

**12**

**STANDING COMMITTEE ON DEFENCE  
(2020-21)**

**(SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA)**

**MINISTRY OF DEFENCE**

[Action taken by the Government on the Observations / Recommendations contained in the Second Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on 'Demands for Grants of the Ministry of Defence for the year 2019-20 on 'Army, Navy, Air Force and Joint Staff (Demand Nos. 19 and 20)'].

**TWELFTH REPORT**



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT**

**NEW DELHI**

**February, 2021 /Magha, 1942 (Saka)**

**TWELFTH REPORT**

**STANDING COMMITTEE ON DEFENCE  
(2020-21)**

**(SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA)**

**MINISTRY OF DEFENCE**

[Action taken by the Government on the Observations / Recommendations contained in the Second Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on 'Demands for Grants of the Ministry of Defence for the year 2019-20 on Army, Navy, Air Force and Joint Staff (Demand Nos. 19 and 20)'].

Presented to Lok Sabha on 12.02.2021

Laid in Rajya Sabha on 12.02.2021



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT**

**NEW DELHI**

February, 2021 /Magha, 1942 (Saka)

## CONTENTS

	<b>PAGE</b>
COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE (2020-21).....	(iii)
INTRODUCTION.....	(v)
CHAPTER I Report.....	1
CHAPTER II a) Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by the Government .....	19
b) Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by the Government and commented upon.....	51
CHAPTER III Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies received from the Government .....	66
CHAPTER IV Recommendations/Observations in respect of which replies of Government have not been accepted by the Committee which require reiteration and commented upon .....	67
CHAPTER V Recommendations/Observations in respect of which Government have furnished interim replies/replies awaited.....	68

## **APPENDICES**

I	Minutes of the third sitting of the Standing Committee on Defence (2020-21) held on 09.02.2021.....	69
II	Analysis of Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Second Report (17 <sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha) of the Standing Committee on Defence (2019-20).....	72

## COMPOSITION OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON DEFENCE (2020-21)

SHRI JUAL ORAM

-

CHAIRPERSON

### Lok Sabha

2. Shri Deepak (Dev) Adhikari
3. Kunwar Danish Ali
4. Shri Ajay Bhatt
5. Shri Devusinh Jesingbhai Chauhan
6. Shri Nitesh Ganga Deb
7. Shri Rahul Gandhi
8. Shri Annasaheb Shankar Jolle
9. Choudhary Mehboob Ali Kaiser
10. Prof. (Dr.) Ram Shankar Katheria
11. Smt. (Dr.) Rajashree Mallick
12. Dr. T.R. Paarivendhar
13. Shri Kapil Moreshwar Patil
14. Shri Anumula Revanth Reddy
15. Shri Jugal Kishore Sharma
16. Dr. Shrikant Eknath Shinde
17. Shri Prathap Simha
18. Shri Brijendra Singh
19. Shri Mahabali Singh
20. Shri Kotagiri Sridhar
21. Shri Durga Das Uikey

### Rajya Sabha

22. Dr. Ashok Bajpai
23. Shri Prem Chand Gupta
24. Shri Sharad Pawar
25. Shri V. Lakshmikantha Rao
26. Shri Sanjay Raut
27. Shri Rajeev Satav
28. Dr. Abhishek Manu Singhvi
29. Shri Kamakhya Prasad Tasa
30. Dr. Sudhanshu Trivedi
31. Lt. Gen. Dr. D. P. Vats (Retd.)

## SECRETARIAT

- |                       |   |                             |
|-----------------------|---|-----------------------------|
| 1. Smt Kalpana Sharma | - | Additional Secretary        |
| 2. Dr. Sanjeev Sharma | - | Director                    |
| 3. Shri Rahul Singh   | - | Deputy Secretary            |
| 4. Smt Rekha Sinha    | - | Assistant Executive Officer |

## INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Defence (2020-21), having been authorized by the Committee, present this Twelfth Report of the Committee on 'Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Second Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on Demands for Grants of the Ministry of Defence for the year 2019-20 on Army, Navy, Air Force and Joint Staff (Demand Nos. 19 and 20)'.

2. The Second Report was presented to Hon'ble Speaker, Lok Sabha on 20.12.2019, presented to Lok Sabha on 31.01.2020 and laid in Rajya Sabha on 13.12.2019. The Report contained 69 Observations/Recommendations. The Ministry of Defence furnished Action Taken Replies on all the Observations/Recommendations in the Action Taken Replies in July, 2020.

3. The Report was considered and adopted by the Committee at their Sitting held on 9 February 2021.

4. For facility of reference and convenience, Observations/Recommendations of the Committee have been printed in bold letters in the Report.

5. An analysis of Action taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Second Report (17th Lok Sabha) of the Standing Committee on Defence is given in Appendix II.

**New Delhi;  
9 February, 2021  
20 Magha, 1942 (Saka)**

**Jual Oram,  
Chairperson,  
Standing Committee on Defence**

## REPORT

### CHAPTER – I

This report of the Standing Committee on Defence deals with action taken by the Government on the observations/ recommendations contained in the Second Report (17th Lok Sabha) on 'Demands for Grants of the Ministry of Defence for the year 2019-20 on Army, Navy, Air Force and Joint Staff (Demand Nos. 19&20)', which was presented to Hon'ble Speaker, Lok Sabha on 20.12.2019, presented to Lok Sabha on 31.01.2020 and laid in Rajya Sabha on 13.12.2019.

2. The Committee's Second Report (17th Lok Sabha) contained 69 observations/ recommendations on the following aspects:-

Para No./Nos.	Subject
ARMY	
1-2	Budget 2019-20
3	Revenue Budget - Non Salary
4-5	Budget Review
6	Percentage share of Army Budget
7-11	Modernization Budget
12	Surveillance in Border Areas
13	Allowances in difficult terrains
14-17	Bullet Proof Jackets(BPJs)
18-19	Force Level
20-21	Manpower
AIR FORCE	
22-26	Budgetary Provisions 2019-20
27	Budget modernization
28	Make in India
29	Fighter Aircraft
30-31	Aircraft shelter
32-34	Trainer Aircraft
35	Transport Planes and Helicopters
36-37	Modernization of Military Airfields
38-39	Accidents
40-41	Manpower
42-43	Training

NAVY	
44	Budgetary Provisions for the Year 2019-20
45	Percentage share of Navy's Budget
46-47	Revenue Budget
48-51	Capital Budget
52-53	Budget Modernization
54-55	Indigenisation
56	Naval Airfields
57-59	Force Level
60	Coastal Security
61-62	Safety of fishermen
63-64	Manpower
65	International Cooperation
JOINT STAFF	
66-67	Budget
68	Defence University
69	Defence Museum

3. Action Taken Replies have been received from the Government in respect of all the recommendations/observations contained in the Report. However, 13 number of replies stated as "classified" have been forwarded to Hon'ble Chairperson's office in sealed cover which include para Nos. 15-19, 31, 56 & 59-64. These replies have been placed under 'accepted' category. However, categorization of these paras may be done again consequently after receipt of the replies/direction from Hon'ble Chairperson. The remaining replies have been examined and the same have been categorised as follows:-

- (i) (a) Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by the Government (please see Chapter II A) :

ParaNos. 1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9,10,11,14,15,16,17,18,19,20,21,22,23,24,25,26,27,28, 29,30,31,33,36,37,38,39,44,45,46,47,48,49,50,51,52,53,54,55,56,59, 60,61,62,63,64,65,66 & 67

**(56 Recommendations)**



(b) Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by the Government and commented upon (please see Chapter II B):

Para Nos. 12,13,32,34,35,40,41,42,43,57,58,68 & 69

**(13 recommendations)**

(ii) Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies received from the Government (please see Chapter III):

Para Nos. Nil

**(00 Recommendation)**

(iii) Recommendations/Observations in respect of which replies of Government have not been accepted by the Committee which require reiteration and commented upon (please see Chapter IV):

Para Nos. Nil

**(00 Recommendation)**

(iv) Recommendations/Observations in respect of which Government have furnished interim replies (please see Chapter V):

Para No. Nil

**(00 Recommendation)**

**4. The Committee desire that the Ministry's response to the comments made in Chapter I should be furnished to them at the earliest and in any case not later than six months of the presentation of this Report.**

**A Surveillance in border areas**

**Recommendation (Para No. 12)**

5. The Committee had recommended as under:-

'During the recent study visit of the Standing Committee on Defence to Eastern Sector from 4 to 9 November, 2019, they came across a request for high-tech state-of-the-art cameras for surveillance purposes. The Committee were intimated that fifteen to sixteen such cameras were required for the posts over there. During oral evidence, the Committee were apprised by the representatives

of Ministry of Defence that they have received request for surveillance equipment. It was also found that the said requirement is not only at Eastern Command but all across the northern borders. The request is being undertaken in two ways. One is a central procurement which takes a little longer but meets the overall requirement. To meet the immediate operational requirement, there is Army Commanders' Special Financial Powers Fund under which the Army Commanders are empowered by such operationally necessary equipment to fill in the gap till such time that the central procurement materializes. The Committee note that despite special powers bestowed upon Army Commanders, surveillance equipments are not installed at the required places. It is desired that the immediate requirement for surveillance equipment at Eastern Command and northern borders including Nathu la Post must be fulfilled at the earliest. Also, complete requirement of the surveillance equipment must be attended to through central procurement as the border areas are sensitive in nature. The Committee emphasize that no stones shall be left unturned in order to develop a fool proof border line.'

6. The Ministry in its Action Taken Reply has stated as under:-

'Proposals to augment/address voids in surveillance grid along the Line of Actual Control / International Boundary as per appreciated operational necessity are projected by forward deployed field formations and these are holistically reviewed at Theatre Level.

2. While operational requirement is the primary driver to determine procurement, it is highlighted that proposals from forward deployed formations are analysed considering the terrain and geography, cost benefit analysis, availability of existing inventory of equipment and proposals being pursued by other stake holders to avoid duplicity, and obviate future challenges to equipment inventory management, are amongst the other factors analysed before procurement of equipment is undertaken. Accordingly, the different types of equipment that are capable of carrying out surveillance including Unmanned Aerial Vehicles(UAVs), satellite imageries unmanned sensors, radars and other equipment with capabilities of thermal imaging as well as infra-red systems, so as to provide all weather surveillance, are procured.

3. Post operational endorsement of requirement, technical parameters and desired operational capabilities of devices are evolved through a Board of Officers to meet the identified operational voids. Specific items and quantities are then taken up for procurement through funds like Army Commander's Special Financial Power (ACSFP).

4. Currently, the following proposals for procurement of surveillance devices are in the General Staff Qualitative Requirements (GSQR) evolution stage under Army Commanders Special Financial Powers (ACSFP) in Financial Year 2019-20:-

<b>Equipment</b>	<b>Endorsed Projects</b>
Spotter Scope With Integrated Camera	77
Long Distance Day/Night PTZ Camera	75

5. The projected requirement of a 'Fog Camera' by the Formation during the subjects visit has capability which is similar to a Long Range Reconnaissance and Observation System (LORROS). Further, with a projected cost of approximately Rs. 23,72,500/- per item and with indigenous systems also under production by DRDO and private industry, who have also displayed potential to manufacture such equipment, the proposed requirement is withheld for the time being, because of other means of surveillance equipment, presently available with forward deployed formations. In order to supplement the human resources, effort is on to develop all weather, day and night capability, which will meet the future requirements, with latest technology. The same will hence be considered after integration of equipment proposals currently under progress and fresh review of operational requirement thereon.'

### **Comments of the Committee**

7. The Committee take note of the efforts being made by Government towards procurement of the required surveillance equipments. In this connection, the Committee would like to be updated on the status of procurement of 77 Spotter Scope with Integrated Camera and 75 Long Distance Day/Night PTZ Cameras in Final Action Taken Notes. Further, the Committee hope that the development of substitutes of fog cameras and of all weather, day and night capability surveillance systems that are presently undergoing indigenous development are progressed within stipulated time frame so as to ensure all weather surveillance at strategic locations. The Committee are also of the view that potential needs of the Army on strategic locations should be taken into consideration with constant dialogue with field formations and procurements of desired equipment be given priority. Since the proposals for procurement are in the evolution stage, they recommend to be apprised about the timelines of development of the aforementioned devices in final Action Taken Notes.

### **B. Allowances in difficult terrains**

#### **Recommendation (Para No 13)**

8. The Committee had recommended as under:-

'In course of the above mentioned study visit of the Committee, they were updated about discrepancies in the allowances paid to the personnel of Central and state Governments, such as the local police in the Gangtok region. The alleged discrepancy ranged up to the level of four or five times in the allowances. The Committee took serious note of the matter. During oral evidence, the representatives of Army deposed before the Committee that various anomalies in allowances have been taken up and the endeavour is to deliver due allowances to all jawans facing hardship. Parity is tried to be maintained between troops

which are deployed at similar areas. In this regard, the Committee were further assured that the matter will be looked into in consultation with Ministry of Defence and the exact figures on the allowances would be furnished. However, the Committee were not furnished the exact figures on the allowances till the time of drafting of this Report. The Committee recommend that Ministry and Army shall resolve the matter at the earliest and befitting allowances shall be paid to the soldiers in parity with other departments so that the morale of the deployed personnel is not dented.'

9. The Ministry in its Action Taken Reply has stated as under:-

'As per Seventh Central Pay Commission(CPC) recommendations, allowances related to risk and hardship have been subsumed in different cells of Risk and Hardship Matrix. The matrix is divided into 9 cells, based on Low, Medium and High risk juxtaposed with Low, Medium and High hardship. One extra cell, has been added to the top: RH Max to include Siachen Allowance. The aforementioned recommendations of the 7<sup>th</sup> CPC were accepted by the Government with some modifications vide Ministry of Finance Resolution dated 06.07.2017. Subsequently, MoD order dated 18.09.2017 was issued to implement aforementioned decision of the Government. Allowances to Uniform services are based on their conditions of services. Some of these are at par with the allowances given to Central Armed Police Forces, Border Security Force, etc. Further, the seventh CPC has recommended that a joint committee of Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Defence should revisit the present classification of places, and future categorizations should also be done as a joint exercise for places where CAPFs are posted. Subsequently the Government decided that classification of Field areas for Defence forces shall be examined by Ministry of Defence and for CAPFs by Ministry of Home Affairs. In pursuance of the aforementioned decision of the Government, a Committee has been constituted in Ministry of Defence vide order dated 22.03.2019 to review classification of field areas for Risk and Hardship Allowance to Defence Service Personnel. The first meeting of the said Committee was held on 9.4.2019. It is pertinent to mention here that Defence Forces are a distinct and unique class in its own and that they are different from other Uniform Services in the sense that the terms & conditions of service, the scheme of selection and appointment, the policy of promotions and Ranks, etc. are different from other Services.'

#### **Comments of the Committee**

**10. The Committee take note of constitution of a joint committee of Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Defence to revisit the present classification of places, and future categorizations aimed towards resolving pay and allowance discrepancies between personnel of different organizations with deployment at a similar place. The constitution of the said committee falls in line with the**

recommendation of the Committee in their original report. However, in this connection, it is pertinent to mention here that Committee, in the first instance should be apprised of broad terms for Reference/Mandate of this Committee and also the targeted date of completion of its inquiry as well as submission of Report relating thereto. It is important for the Committee to know that considerable time has elapsed since the first meeting was held on 9.4.2019. Therefore, the Committee recommend that the aforesaid committee shall progress their work in a time-bound manner and come out with timely resolution so that this issue could be taken to a logical conclusion. Further, it goes without saying that utmost care shall be taken into consideration for pronouncement of allowances for similar duties and working conditions. The Committee emphasize that allowances of the Defence Forces should not be less than that of CAPFs as they are different from other Uniform Services in the sense that the terms & conditions of service, the scheme of selection and appointment, the policy of promotions and Ranks, etc. are different from other Services.

### **C. Trainer Aircraft**

#### **Recommendation (Para No. 32 & 34)**

11. The Committee had recommended as under:-

‘With regard to the trainer Aircraft held by IAF, the Committee were intimated that the existing strength of trainer aircraft is 260 as against the sanctioned strength of 388. Out of 260, 42 Kiran Mk II are not in use anymore. So they are left with only 218 trainer aircraft. Currently the trainer aircraft held in kitty of Air Force include Basic Trainer Aircraft (BTA), Intermediate Jet Trainer (IJT), Advanced Jet Trainer (AJT). Simulators have also been acquired for the Basic Trainer Aircraft and Advance Jet Trainer aircraft. Presently, IAF has two Fixed Base Full mission Simulators (FBFMS), three Cockpit Procedure Trainers (CPTs) and one Avionics Part Task Trainer (APTT) along with associated equipment and infrastructure for the BTA. Similarly for AJT, three CPTs, three APTTs and two FTDs (Flight Training Display) are installed for providing simulator training. The procurement of simulators is built into the contracts of all aircraft that the Indian Air Force is now procuring. The Committee are further updated on the plan to reduce the paucity in number of trainer aircraft. Case for procurement of 38 additional Basic Trainer Aircraft 76 under the ‘Option Clause’ was being processed. However, the same has been deferred for one year. A case for procurement of 20 additional Advanced Jet Trainer aircraft from Hindustan Aeronautics Limited is currently at the Contract Negotiation Stage. Design and Development (D&D) of HTT-40 aircraft is under progress at HAL, Bangalore. HAL has indicated that the development of HTT-40 is expected to be

completed by Dec 2019. The procurement of HTT-40 will be initiated after successful development of aircraft.

The Committee observe that trainer aircraft is extremely critical from the point of view of safety of Indian Air Force pilots. Therefore, there should be no tolerance of any compromise in training module and unavailability of trainer 77 aircraft must be taken seriously. The Government should work towards filling the requirement of trainer aircraft at the earliest.'

12. The Ministry in its Action Taken Reply has stated as under :-

'Based on the Detailed Project Report (DPR) for design & development of a basic Turbo prop trainer (HTT 40), HAL Board in 2013 approved the design and development of HTT-40 with its own internal funds. The full scale development involving detail design and procurement could be started only after Board sanction. The two developed prototypes have so far made about 400 sorties consisting of flights for systems certification, performance evaluation and handling including stall/spins. Hot weather and sea level trials were also carried out for systems certification. All the ground tests required during design and development and fatigue tests of landings gears are also completed. The aircraft meets all the specified system and performance requirements as per the requirement of Indian Air Force. HTT-40 also demonstrated additional capability like running change over (Flight crew change without switching off the engine) and hot refueling (refueling without switching off engine), features that are generally not available in contemporary trainers.

**Stall/Spin:** The aircraft's stall characteristics were assessed and are termed classical and fit for service induction. The aircraft has also demonstrated its ability to enter, sustain 6 turn spins and recover using conventional controls. Close to 200 spins were carried out between the two prototype aircraft thereby proving the consistency and repeatability of its spin characteristics. Flight trials for full spin qualification are under progress.

In order to reduce the effort required during User Evaluation Trials (UET), a team of test pilots from Aircraft System Testing Establishment (ASTE) are deputed for UATT (User Assisted Technical Trials). ASTE pilots have flown sorties for assessing cockpit ergonomics, performance and handling including stall. Top officials of IAF have also undertaken sorties on HTT-40 and have given positive feedbacks. HTT-40 is undergoing final spin refinements to cover all the possible phases of spin inputs including control mishandling etc for the final certification of

the aircraft. It may be noted that the aircraft has to be certified against the Air Staff Requirement (ASR) to be issued by Air HQ post accord of Acceptance of Necessity (AoN). With that aircraft will be offered for User Evaluation Trials (UET) as per the Defence Procurement Procedure (DPP) 2016 guidelines. The initial date for UET was given as June 2020. However, this has now been shifted to 15<sup>th</sup> Sep 2020 due to the lock down impact during which there was no flying undertaken for around 2 months.

The IAF had sought extensive details of Rough Order of Magnitude (ROM) costs of series production aircraft (Order quantity 70) along with simulators, training aids and ground support/handling equipments and the same have been provided in order to process the AoN approval.

No compromise is being made in imparting quality training. IAF has adopted certain changes in flying training syllabus to make training more effective. The learning curve has also been made steeper to weed out weaker pilots before they are posted to operational units. Simulators are being utilised effectively to make trainees more confident in handling modern aircraft. Seventy five Basic Trainer Aircraft have already been procured. A case for procurement of indigenous Basic Trainer Aircraft from HAL has been initiated.'

### **Comments of the Committee**

**13. The Committee infer that basic trainer aircraft are vital for training of pilots in Indian Air Force. In view of this, the induction of indigenously developed trainer aircraft HTT 40 becomes a significant milestone in enhancing training capabilities of Indian Air Force. Therefore, every effort shall be made to ensure early procurement of indigenous basic trainer aircraft. The Committee are hopeful that the User Evaluation Trials (UET) which was scheduled for 15 September 2020 must have been carried out on intended target date. They wish to be updated on the outcome of User Evaluation Trials (UET) in final action taken notes and consequent developments in accomplishing this target.**

## **D. Transport Planes and Helicopters**

### **Recommendation (Para No. 35)**

14. The Committee had recommended as under:-

‘With regard to Transport Planes and Helicopters, it was brought to the knowledge of the Committee that presently, there are some shortages. In some cases, depending on the condition and utilisation of the fleet, intensive life extension studies are conducted and the life span of the air craft extended. No aircraft which has completed its operational life is in use with the IAF. The Committee note that there is no remarkable dearth of transport planes and helicopters as per the sanctioned strength. The Ministry shall endeavour to fill the small gaps that exist. The Committee also desire that a periodic revision of sanctioned strength should be taken up in pursuance with the ever-increasing role and responsibilities of Air Force.’

15. The Ministry in its Action Taken Reply has stated as under:-

‘The modernisation of the armed forces is an ongoing process and is executed in consonance with the roadmap laid down in the Long Term Integrated Perspective Plan (LTIPP). The IAF undertakes its Capital procurement following Defence Procurement Procedure as per the capabilities defined in the LTIPP. The LTIPP is further sub divided into Services Capital Acquisition Plan (SCAP) and Annual Acquisition Plan (AAP). A periodic revision of sanctioned strength of transport aircraft and helicopters is regularly taken up in pursuance with the ever-increasing role and responsibilities of Air Force with the endeavour to fill the small existing gaps. Procurement of C-295 Aircraft (56 nos) is in progress.’

### **Comments of the Committee**

**16. After gleaning through the reply of the Ministry of Defence, the Committee observe that Government is endeavoring to bridge the gap in availability of transport planes and helicopters. With regard thereto, the Committee note that procurement of 56 number of C-295 aircraft is in progress. Further in this connection, the Committee would like to mention that transport planes and helicopters play significant role in ensuring all time preparedness at all locations of Indian Defence Forces. Therefore, they recommend that the above mentioned procurement is carried out in a time bound manner and they be informed about the progress made with regard to in final Action Taken Statements.**



## **E. Manpower & Training**

### **Recommendation (Para Nos. 40-43)**

17. The Committee had recommended as under:-

'The Committee were informed that the Government sanctioned Establishment and Strength of officers and airmen (except Medical & Dental branch) in Indian Air Force, as on 01 October 2019. In case of officers, the sanctioning is for 12,628 while the held strength is 12,159. There is a shortage of 469 officers. The Ministry of Defence intimated that shortage of 469 officers is a variable figure which keeps fluctuating depending on 79 Commissioning cycle, premature separation of officers etc. The induction plans have been revamped so as to gradually bring the strength at par with the sanctioned establishment. In addition, due to robust cadre management planning and implementation, there is likely to be no shortage of officers in the Indian Air Force in due course. The Committee are happy to note the efforts being made to mitigate the deficiency in officer cadre of Air force and wish that the shortfall is minimised to the maximum extent in near future. The Committee may be apprised about the progress made in this regard.

41. In respect of Airmen, the sanctioning is for 142917 posts while the existing strength is 129447, hence a shortfall of 13474. In this connection, the Committee were apprised that 12,739 trainees are undergoing training at various training institutes. In case of airmen, manpower review is undertaken on annual basis. To reduce the deficiency, improvements in training infrastructure have been carried out to accommodate increased number of trainees and available resources (infrastructure and manpower) are being utilised efficiently to support enhanced induction. Induction in airmen cadre was 5000 per annum till 2015. This has been gradually increased to 6,800 from January 2018. The induction has been further increased to 7,600 airmen each year from July 2019 onwards. In view of this, it is expected that Indian Air Force will be able to bring up the strength at par with the authorized establishment in about 5-6 years. Shortages are being addressed in a staggered manner to ensure a favourable HR environment in the long run and to streamline wastages on account of discharge/ superannuation. The Committee take note of various measures being taken by Air Force and desire that induction is carried out in a time bound manner under intimation to them.

42. With regard to training of pilots the Committee found that Air force had been following three aircraft type training pattern. However, due to non-induction of intermediate jet trainer which was being developed by HAL, the two aircraft training pattern started with effect from July 2015 as a pilot project. The Ministry of Defence apprised that the performance of trainees who have undergone this

training pattern has been good. The same is planned to be implemented after the phasing out of Kiran aircraft which is the Intermediate Jet Trainer (IJT) available with Air Force. The Committee opines that adequate training of the manpower is inevitable need. This becomes even more crucial in view of the safety of lives of pilots and aircrew involved. There should be no compromise in training of our pilots so that a healthy pilot cockpit ratio is maintained by Indian Air Force. 43. The Committee were keen to be apprised on timeline of the training programme of first batch of Officers and technicians which is underway with the French Air Force on Rafale. It was brought their knowledge that advanced training of IAF personnel was conducted by the French Air Force (FAF) and commenced from Sep 2018 for one IAF pilot, one Aeronautical Engineer (AE) officer and six technicians. Two additional pilots joined the advanced training in France from March 19. This team has completed the advanced training phase and commenced training on Indian Rafale aircraft from 30 September 2019. The Committee congratulate the Indian Air Force for achieving this feat and desire that all the training and induction programme of Rafale progresses as per stipulated timelines. The Committee hopes to soon witness Rafale flying in Indian skies by Indian Air Force.'

18. The Ministry in its Action Taken Reply has stated as under :-

'The Government sanctioned Establishment and Strength of officers (except Medical & Dental branch) in the IAF, as on **01 Jan 2020**, is as follows:-

<b>Establishment</b>	<b>Strength</b>
12657	12232

Difference of **425** is a variable figure which keeps fluctuating depending on commissioning cycle, premature separation of officers etc. The inductions are planned so as to gradually bring the strength at par with the sanctioned establishment.'

As on 01 Jan 2020, strength of airmen in IAF is **1,32,558** against an establishment of **1,42,917** leading to a deficiency of **10,359**. Additionally, **12,627 trainees** are undergoing training at various training Institutes. Review of requirement of manpower is undertaken on annual basis. To reduce the deficiency, improvements in training infrastructure have been carried out to accommodate increased number of trainees. Further, available resources (infrastructure and manpower) are being utilised efficiently to support enhanced induction. Till 2015, Induction in airmen cadre was 5000 per annum which has been gradually increased to 6800 from Jan 2018. The induction has been increased to 7600 airmen each year from July, 2019 onwards. In view of this, it is expected that IAF will be able to bring up the strength at par with the authorized establishment in about 5-6 years. Shortages are being addressed in a

staggered manner to ensure a favourable HR environment in the long run and to streamline wastages on account of discharge/superannuation.

Induction of Airmen into Indian Air Force is through Scheduled Tests and Recruitment Rallies. Enrollment process of selected candidates are conducted twice in a year (Jan & July each year). No vacancy remains vacant for more than two years since induction is an ongoing as well as time bound process and is being carried out strictly as per the timelines specified.

No compromise is being made in imparting quality training. IAF has adopted certain changes in flying training syllabus to make training more effective. The learning curve has also been made steeper to weed out weaker pilots before they are posted to operational units. Simulators are being utilised effectively to make trainees more confident in handling modern aircraft.

Presently shortage of Kiran aircraft, Intermediate Jet Trainer (IJT) is due to obsolescence and ageing issues. These aircraft are planned to be phased out by 2025-26. HAL made IJT, HTT-36 D&D aircraft project to replace Kiran aircraft is running behind schedule. The procurement of HAL HJT-36 has been delinked and IAF has initiated the process to acquire a new trainer aircraft to replace the Kiran Aircraft.

An Inter-Governmental Agreement was signed between the Government of India and the Government of France on 23 Sep 16 for the procurement of 36 Rafale aircraft. Air Force Station Ambala and Air Force Station Hasimara are designated as two Rafale Main Operating Bases (MOBs). The first aircraft has been handed over on 19 Sep 19 in France with the formal induction ceremony on 08 Oct 19 (87<sup>th</sup> Air Force Day) in France. Total four Rafale aircraft have been accepted by Indian Air Force and are being utilised for training of IAF Pilots and Ground crew at OEM premises in France. The induction of all 36 aircraft is planned to be completed by April, 2022.'

### **Comments of the Committee**

**19. The Committee are happy to note that IAF will be able to bring up the strength at par with the authorized establishment in about 5-6 years and shortages are being addressed in a staggered manner to ensure a favourable HR environment in the long run and to streamline wastages on account of discharge/superannuation. The Committee hope that by taking these measures, IAF will overcome its manpower shortage to the minimum in recent future,**

however, they would like to be apprised about the impact of the measures taken at the time of furnishing of Action Taken Statements.

The Committee take note of repeated delays in completion of the trainer aircraft, viz. HTT40 and Intermediate Jet Trainer. The Committee further observe that such delays would hamper the training module of pilots in Air Force. Therefore, necessary emphasis has to be laid on timely induction of basic and intermediate trainer aircraft in Air Force. The progress made in this regard may be brought to the knowledge of the Committee in final action taken statements.

#### **F. Force Level**

##### **Recommendation (Para No. 57&58)**

20. The Committee had recommended as under :-

‘The Committee are apprised that Indian Navy acquisitions are planned in accordance with the Maritime Capability Perspective Plan (MCPD 2012-27). Further, this has been subsumed in the Long Term Integrated Perspective Plan (LTIPP 2012-27) of the Services and the XIIth Plan. Acquisition of defence equipment is undertaken in accordance with the Defence Procurement Procedure (DPP). Shortfalls are there in Aircraft Carriers, Mine Counter Measure Vessels (MCMVs), Landing Platform Docks (LPDs), Fleet Support Ships (FSSs), submarines, aircraft and helicopters. Cases for induction are being progressed to meet capability shortfall. Currently, Acceptance of Necessity is given for 41 ships and six submarines, the cases for which are at various stages of acquisition. There is a need to accord impetus for replacement of ageing ships submarines, planes and helicopters. This is being done by induction of modern surface ships like Indigenous aircraft carrier, four Destroyers of Project 15B and seven Frigates of Project 17A. There is a severe capability gap of Mine Counter Measure Vessels, Landing Platform Docks (LPDs) for expeditionary operations, survey ships and Diving Support Vessels. Induction of 12 new Mine Counter Measure Vessels, four Landing Platform Docks, four survey vessels and two Diving support ships are being progressed to meet these capability shortfalls. The Committee would like to have a detailed updation note on the progress made in acquisition of ships, submarines, planes and helicopters in the Action Taken Replies.’

21. The Ministry in its Action Taken Reply has stated as under :-

Shipbuilding projects i.e Project 28, Project 15B, Project 71, Project 17A and Survey Vessels (Large) at various Indian Shipyards are at various stages of implementation.

**Project 75.** Induction of two conventional submarines taken place viz. INS Kalvari (delivered to IN on 21<sup>st</sup> Sep 2017 and commissioned on 14<sup>th</sup> Dec 2017) and INS Khanderi (delivered to IN on 19<sup>th</sup> Sep 2019 and Commissioned on 28<sup>th</sup> Sep 2019). The other submarines are at various stages of construction.

**Diving Support Vessels.** Ordering of steel for both the ships has been completed and keel laying for the first vessel was held on 28<sup>th</sup> Dec 2019. Block Construction is in progress inside M/s HSL premises. Ordering of critical equipment required for launching of the ship (Main Engine, Propellers, Das, Thrusters etc) is being progressed by the shipyard on fast track.

**Aircraft.** Deliveries of Dornier, Chetak and ALH are scheduled between January 2019 to November, 2021.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 58)**

It was also found that certain delays had been witnessed in key acquisitions such as vessels and aircraft. Various reasons including delays in Research & Development projects, slippages by Ordnance Factories and vigilance ban on defence companies were cited for the said delays. The Committee urge the Ministry of Defence to look into such slippages and ensure highest level of transparency and probity, whilst achieving timely induction of planned capability. Time and cost overruns deprive Navy from achieving critical capabilities. This also puts extra burden on the exchequer.

### **Reply of the Government**

Reason for slippages/ delays in acquisition of major warships are multifarious. Some of them are mentioned below:-

(a) **Warship Complexities.** Warships are complex, weapon-intensive platforms that are built in small numbers and cannot be prototyped for construction like cars, tanks and aircraft. A weapon-intensive warship is an amalgamation of diverse technologies including Indigenous, Western, Russian and Israeli origin. The need to cater for obsolescence management, i.e. the need to be contemporary at the time of induction of platform demands fitment of

developmental systems/ technology leading to telescopic design & construction with the likelihood of project delays.

(b) **Construction Methodology.** The design is usually undertaken in parallel with construction for platform-level integration of new technologies to mitigate constantly evolving threat scenario in war-fighting. This has inherent challenges with consequent uncertainties. Therefore, because of inherent complexities and uncertainties in shipbuilding, there are special provisions in Defence Procurement Procedures (DPP) with a chapter dedicated to shipbuilding.

(c) **Dependence on Foreign OEMs.** Dependence on foreign OEMs for cutting edge technologies, export regulations, long lead time for IGA conclusion and global sanctions invoked on certain countries are additional factors that could lead to slippages.

(d) **Indigenisation.** All-round emphasis is being placed on indigenisation of equipment manufacture and shipbuilding. While indigenisation is critical to ensure self-reliance and avoid technology/ equipment/ spares support denial in times of hostility, the process can itself cause undue delay in the project schedule. Indigenisation often leads to protracted negotiations with the Transfer of Technology (ToT) firm and teething delays in first time manufacture at Indian firms.

### **Comments of the Committee**

**22. The Committee take note of the repeated delays in completion of various projects of Naval inductions. In this connection, the Committee reiterate their recommendation to put necessary steps in place in order to avoid delays. The targeted projections at different stage must be more streamlined and realistic. In the final Action Taken Notes, the Committee would like to be apprised in detail specifically about the progress made with regard to induction of P75 submarines, and status of deliveries of aircraft including dornier, chetak and Advance Landing Helicopters.**

## **G. Budget Review**

### **Recommendation (Para No. 68)**

23. The Committee had recommended as under:-

‘The Committee found that the project for defence university is under consideration. With regard to the physical progress, it was updated by the representatives of Ministry of Defence that the land had been identified and boundary wall erected. The approval of the Indian Defence University is under consideration at highest level and after its approval the integration process will be started. The Committee appreciate the efforts in this regard and wish to be updated on the progress in Action Taken Replies.’

24. The Ministry in its Action Taken Reply has stated as under :-

‘Post inter-ministerial consultation, advance copies of Cabinet Note on IDU Bill, 2017 has been forwarded to Cabinet Secretariat. The IDU Bill 2017 is pending for approval by Cabinet.’

### **Comments of the Committee**

**25 The Committee find that Indian Defence University Bill 2017 is pending with Cabinet for approval. They would also like to be apprised about the steps being taken to pursue the said bill and bring the same into knowledge of the Committee in final action taken statements.**

## **H. War Museum**

### **Recommendation (Para Nos. 69)**

26. The Committee had recommended as under:-

‘Subsequent to successful implementation of the project for war memorial, the Committee desired to be updated on the status of defence museum. In this regard, representatives of joint staff intimated the Committee that the plan for defence museum is in progress. The Committee hail the idea of defence museum and wish that it soon sees the light of the day.’

27. The Ministry in its Action Taken Reply has stated as under:-

‘The Cabinet approved construction of National War Museum in Oct 2015. MoHUA allotted 14.173 acres of land at Princes Park for construction of National War

Museum in Dec 2016. Govt. Sanction Letter (GSL) for the project was issued on 18 Dec 2015. An Empowered Apex Steering Committee (EASC) and a Project Management Team (PMT) were constituted by the Cabinet with mandate to take all key decisions and oversee execution from conception stage to completion.'

CPWD has been entrusted to identify a suitable architectural design and execute the work for construction of the National War Museum. In this connection, it has been directed to initiate and complete the construction of the National War Museum by December 2022.

### **Comments of the Committee**

**28. The land for construction of National War Museum was sanctioned in December 2016. The reply of the Ministry of Defence states that CPWD has been directed to initiate and complete the construction of the National War Museum by December 2022. The Committee desire that the work is progressed in a time-bound manner and all scheduled milestones are achieved as per projections under intimation to the Committee.**



## CHAPTER II A

### OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS, WHICH HAVE BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE GOVERNMENT

#### **Recommendation (Para Nos. 1-2)**

In the budget estimates of 2019-20, the total projections made by Army was Rs. 1,98,964 crore while the allocation was Rs.1,68,277 crore. The shortfall amounted to Rs. 30,687 crore. Further, sixty-two per cent of total allocated budget, i.e. Rs. 1,04,564 crore being dedicated for salary expenses. The remaining thirty-eight per cent only i.e. Rs. 63,713 crore was available for modernisation, infrastructure, operations and maintenance. The role and responsibilities of Indian Army are enormous which include maintaining territorial integrity along the borders, constantly reviewing its operational preparedness/postures to meet the perceived security challenges, defending the country from external and internal threat, and also providing aid and succour to the affected people in times of disaster/natural calamities. It is also expected that the Army is prepared at all times for any conflict on the northern and western borders. In order to achieve the above mentioned assignments it is indeed essential to continuously train the manpower so as to maintain high levels of readiness. In addition to all this, complementing foreign policy through defence diplomacy by participating in joint training and United Nation peace keeping missions is also one of the mandates of Indian Army. The Committee have been apprised by the Ministry that the policies of the Ministry of Defence are inconsonance with the needs of Army.

In order to meet the above expectations, Army has to maintain a strong motivated and trained force duly equipped to meet the present day challenging security scenario. At the same time they have to regularly upgrade and replace armament along with retaining adequate war reserves. Continued development of infrastructure in peace stations is another vital work at the hands of Indian Army. While keeping in mind the huge mandate and the massive workforce that Army has to sustain, the Committee opine that provision of adequate budgetary support to them is an utmost necessity. Therefore, the shortfalls in budgetary allocation at Budget Estimates stage must be looked into at the Revised Estimates stage. A detailed examination of budgetary provisions to Army along with the requirements is discussed in the succeeding paragraphs.

## **Reply of the Government**

Based on ceilings received from Ministry of Finance in RE 2019-20, an amount of Rs. 1,72,440.73 Crore has been allocated to Army[Revenue(Net)+Capital], which is an increase of Rs. 2,530.99 Crore over BE 2019-20 allocation of Rs. 1,69,909.74 Crore.

However, the Committee is assured that the allocated funds will be optimally and fully utilized towards operational activities. If required, the schemes will be reprioritized to ensure that urgent and critical capabilities are acquired without any compromise to operational preparedness of the Army.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 3)**

As already mentioned in the above paragraph, a major portion of revenue allocation goes to salary component which amounts to Rs. 1,04,564 crore for the year 2019-20, leaving a meager amount for other Revenue expenses. In the BE 2019-20, the projection for Non-salary Revenue budget was Rs. 45,843 crore whereas the allocation Rs. 34,227 crore. The shortfall summed to Rs. 11,626 crore which accounts to nearly twenty-five per cent of the projection. The Committee came to know that the Non-salary revenue budget was necessary for operations and maintenance. Some of the mandatory outgo against this Head includes ration, livery items, transportation, store, compensation, field defences, building maintenance and other miscellaneous expenses. Infrastructure development in peace stations also constitutes part of this outlay. The Committee wish to note that in a situation where our country is facing two front conflict challenges, all time operational preparedness of Army is a binding requisite. Therefore, the Committee recommend that at RE stage, the essential demands of Army under Revenue head which is channelized towards operation and maintenance work shall be given in consonance with the perceived threat to the nation.

## **Reply of the Government**

Army was allocated Rs. 37,080.12 crore (Gross) in BE 2019-20 under Non-Salary segment of Revenue Head. Based on ceilings received from Ministry of Finance in RE 2019-20, an amount of Rs. 38,605.20 has been allocated to Army. This allocation under Non-Salary segment (Gross) in RE 2019-20 implies an increase of Rs. 1,525.08 crore over BE 2019-20 allocations of Army. The Committee is, however, assured that all efforts will be made to ensure that adequate funds are available to meet the critical requirements.

### **Recommendation (Para Nos. 4-5)**

While going through the detailed information on the projections and allocations in respect of Army during the previous years, the Committee found that the expenditure incurred by Army had usually exceeded the allocation. In case of the Revenue segment, in the year 2017-18, the Revised Estimates allocation was Rs. 1,21,451.80 crore while the expenditure incurred was Rs. 1,27,507.48 crore. In the year 2018-19, the expenditure amounted to Rs. 1,34,241.38 crore while the Revised Estimates allocation for the same year was Rs. 1,29,812.34 crore. This depicts that the Army had been able to completely spend the amount allocated to them under revenue head during the past years.

In respect of capital segment of Army budget, the amount of allocation and expenditure for the year 2016-17 was Rs. 25,205.71 crore and Rs. 27,148.26 crore respectively. In the year 2018-19, the allocation was Rs. 26,815.71 crore while the expenditure Rs. 27,438.66 crore. This again showcases that the allocations were completely exhausted without any surrender during a fiscal. During the examination of demands for grants 2019-20, the Committee were apprised that while allocating funds, Ministry of Finance analyses past absorption capacity of the Services and the pace of expenditure in the current Financial Year. Hence, the Ministry of Defence allocate funds to the Services on the basis of expenditure pattern. In this perspective, while noting Army's trend of increased spending, the Committee desire to allocate justified provision for Army during the financial year 2019-20 both against Revenue and Capital Heads.

### **Reply of the Government**

Based on ceilings received from Ministry of Finance in RE 2019-20, an amount of Rs. 1,42,773.83 Crore under Revenue Head was allocated which implies an increase of Rs. 2,3,75.34 Crore over BE 2019-20 allocations. Under Capital Head an amount of Rs. 29,666.90 Crore was allocated (which is an increase of Rs. 155.65 Crore over BE 2019-20 allocations) keeping in view pace of expenditure.

The Committee, is however assured that all efforts will be made to ensure that adequate funds are available to meet the critical requirements.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 6)**

During the examination of the Demands for Grants (2019-20), the Committee found that the percentage share of Army to total Defence budget, in Revenue segment

during the Eleventh Plan Period was 37.87 per cent. This increased to 41.57 per cent during the Twelfth Plan Period. Meanwhile, the share of Capital budget to total defence budget which was 12.13 per cent plummeted to 10.51 per cent during the Twelfth Plan Period. Further, since 2013-14 to 2019-20, the ratio of Capital budget for Army remained constantly between sixteen to twenty per cent. The Committee are in full agreement with the Ministry that boots on ground is an absolute requirement for maintaining high degree of security all along the border. At the same time, they desire that thrust should also be given to modernization aspect of Indian Army. The Committee are apprised by the Ministry that currently certain studies are in the process to rationalize the manpower. Therefore, they, further desire the Ministry to complete the examination expeditiously in order to ensure that the revenue expenditure is reduced to the absolute essential. Capital budget caters mainly for modernization expenses which include capital acquisitions such as guns, tanks, radars and Infantry weapons. It also provides for replacement of in-service armament and equipment, upgradation of obsolete equipment as well as major repairs and overhauls. In order to fight a modern day war, it is pertinent for Army to maintain a duly equipped motivated and trained force. A decline in the percentage share of capital budget showcases unwholesome approach towards modernization of Army. In this regard, the Committee recommend for maintaining a qualified balance between revenue and capital allocations displaying dedication for modernization drive for a well-equipped and robust Indian Army.

### **Reply of the Government**

The higher growth in the revenue expenditure is mainly attributable to the fact that Army is manpower intensive with a large portion of its expenditure devoted to Salaries. This skews the Revenue-Capital ratio in favour of revenue expenditure in overall sense for Army. For Air Force and Navy, the ratio of Revenue to Capital is 47:53 and 40:60 respectively in RE 2020-21.

In RE 2019-20, Rs. 29,666.90 Crore has been allocated to Army under Capital Head (i.e. an increase of Rs. 155.65 Crore over BE 2019-20). Further, under Capital Acquisition (Modernization) Head, an amount of Rs.23,517.31 Crore(i.e. an increase of Rs. 516.68 Crore over BE 2019-20)has been allocated to Army in RE 2019-20. In the next financial year i.e. 2020-21, an amount of Rs. 32,462.38 Crore has been allocated in BE to Army under Capital Head (i.e. an increase of Rs. 2,951.13 Crore over BE 2019-20). Further, under Capital Acquisition (Modernization) Head, an amount of Rs.26,068.61 Crore (i.e. an increase of Rs. 3067.98 Crore over BE 2019-20) has been allocated to Army in BE 2020-21.

### **Recommendation (Para Nos. 7-11)**

It has already been stated above that modernization must be given due attention and impetus during budgeting processes of the Ministry of Defence. However, the same spirit is not inclined in the budgetary provisions. During the year 2018-19, Budget Estimates allocation against modernization was Rs. 21,338.21 crore, Revised Estimates projection was Rs. 34,738.29 crore. Though the amount allocated in Revised Estimates was Rs. 21,168.21 crore. From the above information it can be figured that Rs. 13,400.08 crore was additionally projected in Revised Estimates over Budget Estimates allocation. Conversely, the allocations made at Revised Estimates were even less than the Budget Estimates allocation made to Army under Modernisation (Capital Acquisition) Head (which includes Committed Liabilities and New Schemes). Furthermore, the Committee found that against these allocations, an expenditure of Rs. 21,879.80 crore had been incurred in FY 2018-19. In regard thereto, the Committee were apprised that under Modernisation (Capital Acquisition) Head, Army had sought additional allocation of Rs. 16,293.19 crore and Rs. 13,400.08 crore at first and second supplementary stages respectively, although the Ministry did not receive any additional allocations at the Supplementary stages. The Committee were further informed that when required, the schemes are reprioritized to ensure that urgent and critical capabilities were acquired without any compromise to operational preparedness of the Army.

On going through the documents furnished by the Ministry of Defence, it was found that during each year of Eleventh and Twelfth Plan Periods, the allocations made at Revised Estimates stage were even lesser from that of Budget Estimates stage let go the actual projections made by Army. The data is as given here under:

(Rs. in crore)

<b>Year</b>	<b>BE Allocation</b>	<b>RE Projection</b>	<b>Additional Projection</b>	<b>RE Allocation</b>
<b>XI Plan</b>				
2007-08	6,937.20	6,365.20	-572.00	6,224.20
2008-09	7,607.67	7,655.67	48.00	5,740.03
2009-10	9,821.07	9,821.16	0.09	6,254.35
2010-11	8,876.88	8,876.89	0.01	7,433.23
2011-12	10,740.02	8,982.91	-1,757.11	4,950.02
<b>XII Plan</b>				
2012-13	13,724.14	13,515.90	-208.24	11568.76
2013-14	13,327.04	13,922.00	594.96	10801.46
2014-15	20,935.41	18,585.48	-2,349.93	16927.35
2015-16	22,054.50	20,466.79	-1,587.71	17997.59

2016-17	21,535.26	27,476.22	5,940.96	17,966.46
---------	-----------	-----------	----------	-----------

The Committee regret the budgeting trend towards modernization of Army. The Ministry of defence apprised that they propose requirements projected by Services to Ministry of Finance for favourable consideration. In the opinion of the Committee, modernization and technological advancement of Army is an imperative area. Uniqueness of Army lies in life threatening/hostile situations faced by soldiers on the borders and in counter insurgency/counter terrorist operations on a daily basis. This also involves varying terrain profile and variety in equipment profiling of units. In light of all this, the Committee observe that the Government of the day demonstrates absolute attention towards modernization expenditure which was evidently lacking in the previous time so that the already cropped up deficiencies and scarcities in Army's arsenal is plugged. This again must be reflected in the budget distribution pattern.

In the Budget Estimates 2019-20, against a projection of Rs. 35,581 crore, an amount of Rs. 23,001 crore was allocated to Army for capital acquisitions. It has already been established in the preceding stanza of the report that capital inductions for Army merit due attention. Therefore, it is desirable that the Ministry channelizes the requisite money to Army in Revised Estimates grant.

Another area of capital budget comprises of non-induction Capital budget. This amount goes for Rohtang tunnel and China Study Group (CSG) roads, northern borders development, land and construction works, security related works and Married Accommodation Project. In this regard, the allocations at Budget Estimates were Rs. 6,486 crore against a projection of Rs. 8,525 crore. The Committee again desire for allocation of necessary funds to Army at Revised Estimates allocations under intimation to this Committee.

### **Reply of the Government**

This Ministry had forwarded projections made by Army under Capital Head in RE 2019-20 to Ministry of Finance. Since the ceilings received from Ministry of Finance were less than the projections, an amount of Rs.23,517.31 Crore (i.e. an increase of Rs. 516.68 Crore over BE 2019-20) has been allocated to Army under Capital Acquisition (Modernization) Head. In BE 2020-21, an amount of Rs.26,068.61 Crore (i.e. an increase of Rs. 3,067.98 Crore over BE 2019-20) has been allocated to Army under Capital Acquisition (Modernization).

The Committee is, however, assured that all efforts will be made to ensure that adequate funds are available to meet the critical requirements.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 14)**

In their earlier report the Committee had categorically observed that considering new threats, highest priority should be given to procurement of Bullet Proof Jackets in order to ensure better survivability of the soldier against enemy and terrorist. It was informed by the representatives of Ministry of Defence that procurement of 50,000 Bullet Proof Jackets based upon earlier General Staff Qualitative Requirement (GSQR) (GSQR 878) had already been done through revenue route. Afterwards, the contract for procurement of 1,86,138 Bullet Proof Jackets as per revised GSQR No. 1438 had been concluded in April, 2018 and a quantity of 40,000 of those had already been delivered. While appreciating the efforts made by the Government in this regard, the Committee desire that rest of the Bullet Proof Jackets may also be procured within the stipulated timeframe.

### **Reply to the Government**

So far 60,000 Bullet Proof Jackets have been delivered out of the total contracted quantity of 1,86,138.

### **Recommendations (Para Nos. 20 & 21)**

The authorised strength of Officers in Army excluding Army Medical Corps (AMC), Army Dental Corps (ADC) & Military Nursing Service (MNS) of the Indian Army as on 01 Jan 2019 is 50,312 while the held strength is 42,913. With regard to manpower it was further apprized that Shortage of Officers in the Indian Army is mainly in the Support Cadre consisting of Officers inducted through Short Service Commission in In-service entries. However, due to consistent efforts, there has been a continuous decrease in deficiency of Officers. As on 01 January 2019, deficiency in the Officers cadre has reduced from twenty six per cent (in 2010) to approximately fourteen per cent. In order to enhance intake through the Short Service Commission Entry (SSC), a proposal to make Short Service Commission Entry more attractive is under consideration. A Young Leaders Training Wing has also been commissioned at the Officers' Training Academy (OTA), Chennai to prepare prospective in-service candidates for becoming Officers through the Army Cadet College (ACC) Entry. A proposal of restructuring Permanent Commission (Special List) [PC(SL)] entry is also under examination. In view of the above, it is envisaged that the existing shortage would be mitigated at a faster rate. While appreciating the measures being undertaken by the Government, the Committee urge them to expedite the process so that the gap is bridged at a faster rate.

The authorised strength of Junior Commissioned Officers/Other Rank of Indian Army as on 01 Jan 2019 is 12,23,381 personnel and the held strength is 11,85,146 personnel. This excludes 1,718 Army Postal Service (APS) Non-Regular Junior Commissioned Officers/Other Rank. The Committee were given to understand that the deficiency of Junior Commissioned Officers/Other Rank is normal and the same will be met by recruits under training. In this regard, the Committee wish to urge the Government to take concerted efforts to mitigate the deficiency in manpower so that the soldiers are not faced with additional burden.

### **Reply of the Government**

The authorised strength of the Indian Army Officer cadre was 50,312 as on 01 Jan 2019 whereas the held strength was 42,913. The prevailing shortage in the Officers cadre is primarily due to reduced intake in the support cadre. The same notwithstanding, sustained efforts have resulted in progressive mitigation of the deficiency from a high of 26% in 2010 to approximately 15% in 2019. Simultaneously, a proposal to enhance the intake through Short Service Commission by making it more attractive is at an advanced stage of consideration at the Tri-Service level. With regard to the In-service entries, a proposal for restructuring of the Permanent Commission (Special List) Cadre is under active consideration.

Further, a Young Leaders Training Wing has been established at Officers Training Academy, Chennai in September, 2019. The aim is to groom prospective service candidates for selection through In-service entries viz. Army Cadet College (ACC), Special Commission Officers (SCO) and Permanent Commission (Special List) {PC (SL)}. It is anticipated that the cumulative effect of the above stated measures would expedite the process so that the gap is bridged at a faster rate. There is no dearth of candidates applying for joining the services, but the selection procedure often renders very large numbers, being declared unsuitable. There is a proposal to review the existing evaluation system at the Services Selection Board, particularly psychology evaluation to ensure that candidates are not rejected because of errors in evaluation.

A total of 88,207 vacancies of Junior Commissioned Officers (JCOs) and Other Ranks (ORs) have been released for recruitment during the recruiting year 2019-20. The recruitment is currently under progress. Further, as on date, a total of 58,836 recruits are under training. Hence the existing deficiency in JCOs/ORs will automatically get made up on passing out of the recruits, post completion of training.



### **Recommendation (Para No. 22)**

During the year 2019-20, the projection of Air Force was Rs.1,22,984 crore. Against this, the allocation is only Rs. 69,949 crore accounting to a shortfall of Rs. 53,035 crore which is a considerable amount. The Committee note that contrary to the expenditure trend of the years 2014-15 & 2015-16, the Indian Air Force's expenditure capabilities has been increasing since 2016-17 onwards. In the opinion of the Committee, quantum of deficit budgeting of this extent would certainly hamper the modernization and operational preparedness of Air force. The Indian Air Force is pursuing a focussed modernization plan to transform into a strategic aerospace power with full spectrum capability. Continuous upgradation of the existing equipment and induction of new weapon platforms and systems is needed. Then there are future inductions of Rafale aircraft, SU30 MK1, indigenous Light Combat Aircraft (LCA), Attack helicopters, heavy lift helicopters, combat support elements, surface-to air guided weapon and air defence radars required to bolster operational capability and capacity. The representatives of Air Force state that the Procurement of LCA MK1A, Request for Proposal for more 110 fighter aircraft will be subject to availability of resources. Adequacies in budgetary provisions are quintessential to ensure that Indian Air Force continues to progress on the desired trajectory of modernisation. Keeping in view the absorption capacity of IAF to spend the money and induction plan of many squadrons as mentioned above, the Committee wish to emphasize upon availability of adequate budgetary allocations lest the present and future plan to enhance the capabilities of IAF will be jeopardised.

### **Reply of the Government**

In RE 2019-20, an amount of Rs. 29,951.69 Crore under Revenue Head (i.e. an increase of Rs. 350 Crore over BE 2019-20) and Rs. 44,947.19 Crore under Capital Head (i.e. an increase of Rs. 5,600 Crore over BE 2019-20) has been allocated to Air Force. Overall there was increase of Rs. 5,950 Crore in Air Force's allocations in RE 2019-20 over BE 2019-20.

The Committee is however, assured that all efforts will be made to ensure that adequate funds are available to meet the critical requirements.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 23)**

The budget has two components viz. Revenue and Capital. The Revenue budget caters mainly for salary expenses. During the year 2019-20, the total projection under revenue head made by Air Force was Rs. 41,682 crore whilst the allocation Rs. 30,602

crore creating a shortfall of Rs. 11,080 crore. Air Force had sought Rs.18,172 crore for salary expenses against which Rs.17,116 crore was allocated. Besides salary expenditure, the Revenue budget also comprises of Non-salary revenue expenditure which goes for operational and maintenance work. In this segment Rs. 23,510 crore was projected and Rs. 13,486 crore actually allocated accounting to a shortfall of Rs. 10,024 crore. The representatives of Air Force candidly submitted before the Committee that the impact of shortfall in Revenue Budget can be felt in aircraft maintenance, serviceability and training. It was also cited that the older systems require more maintenance. Providing support to civil administration and humanitarian assistance during disasters is also a vital task that Air Force takes up time and again. Taking note of the demand made by Air Force, the Committee recommend for allocating adequate budgetary provision in non-salary revenue budget. The Committee may be apprised of the steps taken in this regard.

### **Reply of the Government**

Based on ceilings received from Ministry of Finance in RE 2019-20, an amount of Rs. 13,885.66 crore was allocated to Air Force under Non-Salary head. This amounts to increase of Rs. 400 crore over BE 2019-20 allocations. Though the allocations received in RE 2019-20 are less than the projected requirements, the Committee is assured that the allocated funds will be optimally and fully utilized towards operational activities. If required, the schemes will be reprioritized to ensure that urgent and critical capabilities are acquired without any compromise to operational preparedness of the Air Force.

### **Recommendation (Para Nos. 24-25)**

In case of the Capital segment, the Budget projection during the year 2019-20 was Rs. 81,302 crore, however the allocation is a mere Rs. 39,347 crore. There is a deficit of Rs. 41,955 crore. The Capital budget is required for acquisitions and also 10(i) which is a special power to Vice-Chief. For the purpose of acquisition and 10 (i), Rs. 76,413 crore was sought, whereas the allocation was Rs. 36,410 crore. The shortfall of Rs. 40,003 crore is more than 50 per cent of the requirement. According to the presentation demonstrated by representatives of Air Force enormous shortfall in Capital budget would hit pace of modernization and new schemes become a challenge.

At the time of evidence, the Committee learnt that the allocations are made to Services on the basis of their past record of consumption levels. Air Force had been able to expend the funds allocated to them both under Revenue and Capital heads during the previous years. In 2018-19, the allocation under revenue head at Revised

Estimates stage was Rs. 28,105.43 crore while the eventual expenditure incurred was Rs. 28,291.25 crore. Under capital head the allocation at RE stage was Rs. 35,770.17 crore and the final expenditure incurred by Air Force was Rs. 36,451.74 crore. The Committee were assured by the representatives of Air Force that the allocated funds were optimally utilized to ensure operational preparedness. Based on the available budgetary resources, IAF prioritize their expenditure. From this, one can clearly conclude that lack of adequate budget resources affect the pace of modernisation and the capabilities of IAF are being compromised. Therefore, the Committee opine that Air Force certainly needs adequate budgetary support to retain current operational capability and maintain credible deterrence along with continuing advancements on the modernization trajectory. Induction of fighter aircraft and other aviation capabilities are capital intensive areas. These are critical requirements of Air force required to fill the massive paucity in authorization and availability of platforms which has resulted from ignorance during many past decades. The Committee do appreciate the recent efforts of the Government made towards bridging gaps in depleting squadron strength of Indian Air force. The spirited intentions has to be supported with adequate funding. Therefore, the Committee desire the Ministry of Defence to judiciously enhance the budgetary allocation at RE stage and in their future budget too.

### **Reply of the Government**

In RE 2019-20, Air Force has been allocated Rs. 44,947.19 Crore under Capital Head, which is an increase of Rs. 5,600 Crore over BE 2019-20 allocations. Of the total additional allocations received under Capital Head in RE 2019-20, Air Force has got maximum share i.e. 80%. In BE 2020-21, Air Force's share in Capital Head is Rs. 43,281.91 Crore which is 38% of Capital Head allocation in Defence Services Estimates. In the event of requirement of additional funds during the course of next financial year, additional allocations will be sought at supplementary/RE stage.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 26)**

The percentage share of Air Force budget to total defence budget has also plummeted from 11<sup>th</sup> Plan period to 12<sup>th</sup> Plan period. The percentage of capital share during 11<sup>th</sup> plan period was 17.06 percent which declined to 14.88 per cent in the 12<sup>th</sup> plan period. The percentage share of revenue budget was 10.15 per cent and 9.20 per cent in 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> plan periods respectively. The Committee are perplexed at the state of affairs concerning the budgetary provisions to Air Force. The role and responsibility of Air Force is enormous even during peace time. Instances like movement of Central Armed Police Force post Pulwama and airlifting of mortal remains

of Central Armed Police Force on 15 February 2019 are some of the examples where Air Force has to extend their responsibility. The kitty of Air force is depleting as most of the currently held aircraft including transport and trainer are surviving on extensions such as 'Kiran' Intermediate Jet Trainer. In such a scenario, reduction in budget share of Air force to total defence budget is indicative of passable approach of Ministry of Defence. The Committee reiterate their recommendation for adequate and judicial budget grant to Air force enabling them to accomplish their assignments professionally.

### **Reply of the Government**

In BE 2019-20, Air Force's allocation under both, Revenue and Capital Head, amount to Rs. 68,948.88 Crore. This amount is Rs.73,244.57 Crore in BE 2020-21 i.e. an increase of Rs.4,295.69 Crore. It is further submitted that based on progress of expenditure during the course of the financial year, additional funds will be sought at supplementary/RE stage.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 27)**

Gleaning through the documents furnished by the Ministry of Defence, the Committee explored that in the year 2011-12 which was the last year of 11<sup>th</sup> plan period, the final allocation for modernization as a modified appropriation was Rs. 26,640.53 crore. Further, at the end of the 12<sup>th</sup> plan period in the year 2016-17, the final appropriation for modernization was Rs. 26,895.15 crore. The Committee are baffled to find the same. During examination of Demands for Grants 2019-20, the Committee were educated that the Indian Air Force is pursuing a focussed modernization plan to transform into a strategic aerospace power with full spectrum capability. However, the growth in modernization budget is negligible from the end of the 11<sup>th</sup> plan towards the end of the 12<sup>th</sup> plan. This budgetary allocation should be surmised taking into consideration the rate of inflation also. The Committee observe that modernization budget must be in consonance with the envisaged strength of Indian Air Force so that the vision does not remain mere ink on paper.

### **Reply of the Government**

In BE 2019-20, an amount of Rs. 36,409.89 Crore was allocated to Air Force under Capital Acquisition (Modernization). Based on progress of expenditure and additional requirement of committed liabilities, this amount was increased by Rs. 5,390 Crore in RE 2019-20 to Rs. 41,799.89 Crore.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 28)**

The Committee were educated on the initiation of process for providing the desired impetus to the domestic defence manufacturing industry through 'Make in India'. Indian Airforce had identified 06 potential 'Make' Projects as per Chapter III of Defence Procurement Procedure 2016. These projects are envisaged for execution through private industries of the country. In an effort to strengthen the indigenous defence production base, as part of indigenisation and drive to obtain key technologies, the Ministry of Defence has been striving to include the private sector in production of defence equipment. However, further it was intimated by the representatives of Air Force that considering the high end technology involved and the long gestation periods of defence projects, the tangible changes on ground will take some time. The Committee are pleased with the above developments and wish to soon witness progress in technologies which are critical for self sufficiency in national defence such as aero-engine etc.

### **Reply of the Government**

1. The Make-II procedure provides for indigenous development of defence items where there is no Government funding for prototype development, however, there is an assurance of orders after successful prototype development. Separate procedure for 'Make-II' sub-category has been notified in DPP wherein a number of industry friendly provisions have been introduced. This effort of the Government to promote industry participation in indigenous development of defence items has yielded extremely encouraging response. Since the notification of the Make-II Procedure, 44 projects relating to Army, Navy & Air Force, have been accorded 'Approval in Principle', out of which 9 projects have been issued Project Sanction Order.

2. HAL has been contributing to 'Make in India' since its inception by way of manufacturing aircraft/helicopter, aero engines, systems and accessories within the country both from in-house R&D efforts and under licence from OEMs. Over the years, HAL has produced 17 platforms out of indigenous design and development efforts and another 14 types under license from foreign OEMs. Every year, HAL indigenizes more than 1500 items comprising of critical LRUs, sub-assemblies and parts in the effort to provide continued support for sustenance of the fleets and avoid production/ repair overhaul hold ups. Few major systems indigenised recently include Automatic Flight Control System (AFCS), Integrated Avionics and Display System (IADS), Real Time

Operating System (RTOS), Mission Computer, Solid State Flight Data Recorder (SSFDR), Tactical Air Navigation (TACAN) etc. being fitted on various platforms, all of which act as effective import substitutes. These efforts of HAL have been instrumental in bringing self-sufficiency in critical technology segments in defence manufacturing. Yet another instance is the design and development of 25 kN turbofan engine (HTSE-25) and the 1200 kW turbo shaft engine HTSE-1200 under progress at HAL as attempts towards building self-sufficiency in aero engine technology.

3. To align with national priorities and ensure inclusive growth, HAL has been encouraging Indian private sector participation in the indigenization/ Make in India efforts to undertake various high value systems/equipment of foreign origin fitted on HAL platforms so as to reduce dependence on imports and manage obsolescence, thus fostering self-reliance. HAL has been supporting the private industries, with more than 2000 registered sub-contractors, by extending technical support and close hand holding, which includes several MSMEs also. These capability development spearheaded by HAL has rendered many Indian suppliers to be rightly part of global aerospace supply chain. LCA manufacturing at HAL and prior to that, Su-30MKI production under ToT are solid examples of this manufacturing ecosystem development in the country.

4. HAL has also identified and hosted more than 1000 items of HAL manufactured / supported fleet in its website which can be taken up by the Indian Private Industry under Make-II.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 29)**

The Committee found that presently the Indian Air Force (IAF) should be well equipped to face any security challenges. For this, they should have adequate number of squadron strength and the Government should examine all suitable options in this direction. It was submitted by the representatives of Air Force during oral evidence that the said induction were obviously subject to available budgetary resources. The Committee in the preceding stanzas have already pointed out the inadequacies in budget for modernization. It is needless to state that the Air Force must get their dues to keep themselves equipped with latest state-of-the-art fighter aircraft and modern day weaponry to meet any eventualities. Accordingly, necessary funds must be channelized for the same.

### **Reply of the Government**

Allocation of Air Force under Capital Acquisition (Modernization) was increased by Rs. 5,390 Crore in RE 2019-20 (Rs. 41,799.89 Crore) from BE 2019-20 allocation of

Rs. 36,409.89 Crore. It is further added that Air Force's allocation for modernization is highest (46.53 %) among all the Services under Capital Acquisition allocation in RE 2019-20.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 30)**

The Committee took note of the requirement of adequate number of aircraft shelters in Air Force. The aircraft are damaged by various means which include birds, dust etc. The deposition of waste in adjacent areas of aircraft parking results into hovering of scavengers which also harm the parked fleet. The Committee recommend for appropriate waste management in close proximity so that parked planes are not subject to such destruction.

### **Reply of the Government**

1. Appropriate waste management system has been ensured in all IAF bases and formations so as to preclude any deposition and scope of manual scavenging. Effective implementation of conservancy services has aided clearance of garbage from the IAF camps and has minimized damage to aircraft from avian. Towards effective waste management and appropriate disposal in adjacent civil localities of flying bases, periodic awareness drive has been ensured to spread the message of flight safety as well as the objectives of cleanliness drive stipulated in 'Swachh Bharat' campaign. Besides, Solid Waste Management system as per SWM Rules 2016 has also been instituted at major flying bases to ensure adherence to 'Green' norms laid down by Gol.

2. IAF has taken various other steps for waste management and to control the bird activity around airfields. The details are placed as **Annexure-I**.

**Annexure I**

### **STEPS BY IAF TO ADDRESS THE ISSUE OF BIRD STRIKES**

1. **Management of Solid Waste Management (SWM) Plants.** The issue pertaining to management of Solid Waste Management Plants was taken up with Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs and Ministry of Drinking Water and Sanitation vide D.O. No. 2(2)/2019/D(Air-II)/20/Def Sec dated 18 Feb 2019. Meanwhile, Command HQ are maintaining close liaisoning with Chief Secretaries of concerned states to tag the issue and to seek specific directions for implementation of Solid Waste Management Projects expeditiously.

2. **Bird Hazard Combat Team (BHCT)**. There is a dedicated team of 630 airmen posted at various airfields to watch, report and scare birds from the bird sanitisation zone. In addition, additional personnel are augmented as required. IAF has one Admin Safety and Inspection Officer posted in each of its base to oversee the functioning of BHCT.
3. **Ornithology Cell**. IAF has set up a scientific body of Ornithology to continuously study the bird hazard, to train officers and men on Bird Hazard management. This is functional at Dte of Aerospace Safety at Air HQ (RKP).
4. **Scaring Equipment**. Many bird scaring/ deterrence devices such as 12 Bore guns, Gas cannons, six shot launchers, Distress call generators and custom made crackers are used extensively in IAF bases to avoid birds.
5. **DNA Bar-Coding Technology**. IAF uses DNA bar-coding technology to identify the species involved in BS and uses the data to design species specific modules for various bases.
6. **Bird Detection and Monitoring Radar (BDMR)**. IAF is in the final stages of getting the BDMR systems scaled. The procurement process will start thereafter.
7. **Vegetation Management**. The vegetation of the IAF bases is kept under control through huge mechanical and manual force effort.
8. **Entomological Studies**. To understand the problem of bird activity, studies are being conducted on the insect activity over airfields with the help of Entomologists. Considerable amount of insecticides are used to check the insect population.
9. **Development of New techniques**. IAF has developed new techniques such as Dog walking module, restriction on operations on full moon nights and Drum beating module after experimentation and data analysis. The height of the grass to be maintained has been fine-tuned.
10. **Exchange of Best Practices**. IAF interacts regularly with civil airports and exchanges best practices on the Airport Operators' Safety Group (AOSG) platform.
11. **Pigeon Menace Control**. Liaison is being maintained with local population to reduce Pigeon rearing.



12. **Awareness.** IAF has taken steps to increase awareness about the BS Hazard and unauthorised construction near the IAF airfields.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 32)**

With regard to the trainer Aircraft held by IAF, the Committee were intimated that the existing strength of trainer aircraft is 260 as against the sanctioned strength of 388. Out of 260, 42 Kiran Mk II are not in use anymore. So they are left with only 218 trainer aircraft. Currently the trainer aircraft held in kitty of Air Force include Basic Trainer Aircraft (BTA), Intermediate Jet Trainer (IJT), Advanced Jet Trainer (AJT). Simulators have also been acquired for the Basic Trainer Aircraft and Advance Jet Trainer aircraft. Presently, IAF has two Fixed Base Full mission Simulators (FBFMS), three Cockpit Procedure Trainers (CPTs) and one Avionics Part Task Trainer (APTT) along with associated equipment and infrastructure for the BTA. Similarly for AJT, three CPTs, three APTTs and two FTDs (Flight Training Display) are installed for providing simulator training. The procurement of simulators is built into the contracts of all aircraft that the Indian Air Force is now procuring. The Committee are further updated on the plan to reduce the paucity in number of trainer aircraft. Case for procurement of 38 additional Basic Trainer Aircraft under the 'Option Clause' was being processed. However, the same has been deferred for one year. A case for procurement of 20 additional Advanced Jet Trainer aircraft from Hindustan Aeronautics Limited is currently at the Contract Negotiation Stage. Design and Development (D&D) of HTT-40 aircraft is under progress at HAL, Bangalore. HAL has indicated that the development of HTT-40 is expected to be completed by Dec 2019. The procurement of HTT- 40 will be initiated after successful development of aircraft.

### **Reply of the Government**

Based on the Detailed Project Report (DPR) for design & development of a basic Turbo prop trainer (HTT 40), HAL Board in 2013 approved the design and development of HTT-40 with its own internal funds. The full scale development involving detail design and procurement could be started only after Board sanction.

The two developed prototypes have so far made about 400 sorties consisting of flights for systems certification, performance evaluation and handling including stall/spins. Hot weather and sea level trials were also carried out for systems certification. All the ground tests required during design and development and fatigue tests of landings gears are also completed. The aircraft meets all the specified system and performance requirements as per the requirement of Indian Air Force.

HTT-40 also demonstrated additional capability like running change over (Flight crew change without switching off the engine) and hot refueling (refueling without switching off engine), features that are generally not available in contemporary trainers.

**Stall/Spin:** The aircraft's stall characteristics were assessed and are termed classical and fit for service induction. The aircraft has also demonstrated its ability to enter, sustain 6 turn spins and recover using conventional controls. Close to 200 spins were carried out between the two prototype aircraft thereby proving the consistency and repeatability of its spin characteristics. Flight trials for full spin qualification are under progress.

In order to reduce the effort required during User Evaluation Trials (UET), a team of test pilots from Aircraft System Testing Establishment (ASTE) are deputed for UATT (User Assisted Technical Trials). ASTE pilots have flown sorties for assessing cockpit ergonomics, performance and handling including stall.

Top officials of IAF have also undertaken sorties on HTT-40 and have given positive feedbacks.

HTT-40 is undergoing final spin refinements to cover all the possible phases of spin inputs including control mishandling etc for the final certification of the aircraft. It may be noted that the aircraft has to be certified against the Air Staff Requirement (ASR) to be issued by Air HQ post accord of Acceptance of Necessity (AoN). With that aircraft will be offered for User Evaluation Trials (UET) as per the Defence Procurement Procedure (DPP) 2016 guidelines. The initial date for UET was given as June 2020. However, this has now been shifted to 15<sup>th</sup> Sep 2020 due to the lock down impact during which there was no flying undertaken for around 2 months.

The IAF had sought extensive details of Rough Order of Magnitude (ROM) costs of series production aircraft (Order quantity 70) along with simulators, training aids and ground support/handling equipments and the same have been provided in order to process the AoN approval.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 36)**

The IAF is in the process of upgrading the navigational facilities at all its airfields under the Modernisation of Air Field Infrastructure (MAFI) project to improve the operational environment and enhance aerospace safety in two phases. Contract for Phase-I of turnkey was signed with M/s TATA Power on 16 March 2011 for modernisation of 30 airfields in five batches of six airfields each. The contract deliverables are expected to be completed by December 2019. The implementation of MAFI Phase-II that involves 37 airfields of IAF, Navy and Ministry of Home Affairs has also been approved under Option Clause. Contract Negotiation Committee (CNC) has already submitted its recommendations. The case is at Committee on Financial Approval stage. The Committee recommend for expediting the approval process so the work is initiated.

### **Reply of the Government**

Project Modernisation of Airfield Infrastructure (MAFI) Phase-I covering 30 IAF airfields was signed on 16<sup>th</sup> March 2011. Modern navigational aids (ILS, DVOR/DME, TACAN, RVR, ATMS and Air Field Lightening System) have been installed at all the 30 bases. MAFI Project Phase-I was completed on 15<sup>th</sup> Dec 2019. Approval of Competent Authority for MAFI Phase-II covering 37 airfields of IAF, Navy and Coast Guard has been obtained in April 2020.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 37)**

The Committee also take note of the quantum jump in expenditure under MAFI-I from 2016-17 to 2017-18 onwards where the expended amount hiked from Rs. 13925.55 crore to Rs. 61452.83 crore. The completion of all the contractual obligation is scheduled for December 2019. The Committee desire that the stipulated contract targets are attained within the scheduled timeline.

### **Reply of the Government**

The contracted amount for MAFI Phase-I is Rs. 1215.35 Cr. Supply and Commissioning of MAGI deliverables as part of MAFI Phase-I has been completed by the M/s Tata Power (SED) on 15<sup>th</sup> Dec 2019. Payment amounting to Rs. 1181.29 Crore have already been made to vendor till 01<sup>st</sup> Jan 2020. The last milestone payment is being processed.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 38)**

Accident of aircraft is a matter of concern for the Committee. Although there has been some reduction in occurrence of accidents owing to various measures taken over years, yet the Committee desire that none of pilot or aircraft is lost in any accident. The number of accidents has reduced from an average of 13 accidents per year in 11<sup>th</sup> plan to an average of 08 accidents per year in 12<sup>th</sup> plan. During the study visit of the Committee from 4 to 9 November, 2019, to North-eastern Command, it was brought to their notice that majority of the aircraft available with Indian Air Force are getting old. This also leads to accidents and pilots are lost. The Committee observes that proper training to aircrew is utmost necessary.

### **Reply of the Government**

Indian Air Force has a mix of both modern and old aircraft. The training imparted to the trainees at flying training establishments prepares them adequately to fly all type of aircraft. There are adequate checks and balances to ensure that every pilot is adequately trained to fly the type of aircraft he is assigned. Training of pilots continues in the Squadrons and continuity training is imparted regularly to ensure proper standards are maintained.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 39)**

During examination of Demands for Grants of Indian Air Force, the Committee found that the court of inquiry team has completed investigation in AN-32 aircraft crash on 03 Jun 2019. The accident had lead to loss of many lives. The reasons for the said accident were cited as Aircraft entering in the wrong valley due to Navigational Error in bad weather and the crew was unable to fly the aircraft safely out of the blind valley due to poor visibility and clouding. The Committee recommend that weather updates shall be taken into due consideration before flying an aircraft.

### **Reply of the Government**

It is a routine practice in IAF to take detailed Meteorological briefing regarding destination and enroute weather before any sortie. Weather updates are regularly given to the pilots till the sortie is completed. However, in North East areas and in hills, the weather changes are rapid and difficult to predict adequately / accurately. The IAF has instituted various measures to reduce accidents, especially due to navigational errors due to bad weather. The following measures are in vogue for all transport sqns/units involved in valley flying operations: -

- (a) The weather of the Advance Landing Grounds (ALG), Dropping Zone (DZ) and the valleys are monitored every half hourly / hourly basis and a sortie is launched after assessment of the weather and with experienced crew.
- (b) Considering rapidly changing weather in hilly terrain, weather updates are passed to the aircraft by the Air Traffic Control (ATC) or relayed through other aircraft flying in sector or in radio contact.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 44)**

The Committee note that Indian Navy is prime element of India's maritime power. It plays pivotal role in shaping maritime domain and safeguarding national maritime interests. The sea frontiers are turning out to be a preferred spot for operation by terrorists. Ocean region is also submerged with importunate danger from pirates. The ever-growing maritime challenges complicate the task at hand of Indian Navy which include serving national interest not only from security point of view but also on trade angle.

On this account, Navy was allocated Rs. 41,259 crore against the projection of Rs. 64,307.27 crore in Budget Estimates 2019-20. This accounts to a shortfall of Rs. 13,048 crore. The Committee view the huge shortage in the allocation to Navy seriously. The Committee strongly feel that the deterrence capabilities of Indian Navy has to be strengthened further to establish a strong control in Maritime Domain. Therefore, the Committee wish to emphasize that the ministry should take concerted efforts to impress upon the Ministry of Finance to enhance the allocation as per the needs of Navy to augment the modernization efforts at the earliest to address the critical capabilities void. The Committee may be apprised of the steps taken in this regard.

### **Reply of the Government**

In BE 2019-20, Navy's allocation under both Revenue and Capital head was Rs. 41,258.73 Crore. This amount is Rs.44,744.01Crore in RE 2019-20 i.e. an increase of Rs.3,485.28 Crore. Further, BE 2020-21 allocation of Navy is Rs. 45,161.59 Crore i.e. Rs. 3,902.86 Crore more than BE 2019-20 allocations. It is further submitted that based on progress of expenditure during the course of next financial year, additional funds will be sought at supplementary/ RE stage.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 45)**

The Committee also note that the percentage share of naval budget to total defence budget has also witnessed downfall during the current decade. In 2012-13 the share was 18.12 per cent and In the year 2014-15, it was 16.51 per cent which plummeted to 14.47 per cent in the year 2018-19. The reduction is prominent in capital segment which declined from 10.41 percent in 2014-15 to 7.46 per cent in 2018-19. In BE 2019-20 this has been reduced further to 13.66 per cent. As stated earlier, capital budget defines seriousness of Government with regard to modernization of Navy, though the lower allocations reflect otherwise. The Committee were intimated that the allocated funds were optimally and fully utilized toward operational activities. The Committee wish that the Ministry of Defence take measure to ensure that urgent and critical capabilities are acquired without any compromise to operational preparedness of the Indian Navy. The allocations to the Indian Navy as percentage share of the defence budget needs attention as the share in the defence budget has seen a steady decline from 18 % in Financial Year 12-13 to 13 % in Current Financial Year. The Committee opine that there is a need to enhance the share of Indian Navy Budget keeping in view the increasing operational commitments.

## Reply of the Government

A comparative chart of Navy's BE allocation vis-à-vis Defence Services Estimates for the last few years is tabulated below:

(Rs in Crore)

Year	Defence Service Estimates (Net)	Navy * [Revenue (Net) + Capital]	%age share
2015-16	2,46,727.00	40,528.88	16.43
2016-17	2,49,099.00	39,424.88	15.83
2017-18	2,59,261.90	37,841.98	14.60
2018-19	2,79,305.32	40,419.53	14.47
2019-20	3,05,296.07	45,368.14	14.86
2020-21	3,23,053.00	49,623.03	15.36

(\* including Joint Staff)

It may be seen in the above table that percentage (%) share of Navy's allocations vis-à-vis Defence Services Estimates is approx. 15-16%. Further, there is consistent increase in allocations in absolute terms as well as Percentage-wise from 2018-19 onwards. In fact in 2020-21, Navy's share is 15.36% of the total allocations under Defence Services Estimates. It may also be relevant to mention that the funds are allocated to Services keeping in view various factors e.g. ceilings conveyed by Ministry of Finance; pending Committed liabilities; trend of expenditure; absorption capacity etc. Keeping a certain percentage of Defence budget for a particular Service may not be appropriate as it may be disadvantageous to requirements of other Services.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 46)**

The Navy's Budget has two components viz. Revenue and Capital. In Budget Estimates 2019-20, the Revenue allocation is Rs. 19032.47 crore and the Capital allocation is Rs. 22227.53 crore. A major portion of the revenue budget is dedicated to Salary expenditure which is a mandatory outgo and the remaining for Non-salary revenue expenditure which include other operational and maintenance needs. The Revenue projection of Navy under the head Non-salary was Rs. 13550.34 crore and the allocation Rs. 9871.20 crore. The shortfall amount is Rs. 3679.14 crore. The allocation is only 72 per cent of the projections. The obligatory expense from the non-salary revenue budget includes ration, livery items, transportation, store, compensation, field defences, building maintenance and other miscellaneous expenses. According to the representatives of Navy, even maintenance and serviceability of ships, submarines, aircraft and upkeep of ageing infrastructure becomes difficult. The Committee noted that additional burden of 10 (i), emergency procurements, customs duties, Goods Services Tax(GST), fuel prices and inflationary pressures have not been factored. Therefore, there is a requirement of additional funds under non-salary segment to progress operations, maintenance and training activities. The Committee recommend that requisite funds are provided to Navy under non-salary revenue head so as to ensure all time operational preparedness as national security is paramount and no compromise shall be made in this regard.

### **Reply of the Government**

Based on ceilings received from Ministry of Finance in RE 2019-20, an amount of Rs. 10,171.20crore was allocated to Navy under Non-Salary head. This amounts to increase of Rs. 300 crore over BE 2019-20 allocations. Though the allocations received in RE 2019-20 are less than the projected requirements, the Committee is assured that the allocated funds will be optimally and fully utilized towards operational activities. If required, the schemes will be reprioritized to ensure that urgent and critical capabilities are acquired without any compromise to operational preparedness of the Navy.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 47)**

As regards the budget for ten days intensive war is concerned, the representatives of Navy explained that all the Forces have to keep themselves prepared. Under this directive given by the honourable Raksha Mantri additional financial powers were given



to vice-chief to plug the gap that was required for 10 days of intensive battle. The Committee opine that the arms, ammunition and other equipments need continuous replacement and up gradation. Therefore, the budget provided against 10(i) must be exclusive. The Committee opine that any concession in this regard will dilute the intent of the directive.

### **Reply of the Government**

This Ministry is in agreement with the recommendation of the Committee. All efforts will be made to ensure that sufficient funds are available to meet expenditure on account of critical requirements including 10(i). If required, the schemes will be reprioritized to ensure that urgent and critical capabilities are acquired without any compromise to operational preparedness.

### **Recommendation (Para Nos. 48-49)**

The Capital budget includes budget for modernization, land and works. The Committee found that in the year 2014-15 the capital expenditure was Rs.22269.66 crore. This amount declined in the year 2018-19 to Rs. 21509.60 crore Total projection for capita budget of Navy was Rs. 35713.84 crore whereas the allocation Rs. 22227.53 crore. Against land and works, the allocation is Rs. 1050.53 crore against the projection Rs. 3470.47 crore. In case of modernization, the projection in BE 2019-20 of Navy was Rs. 32243.37 crore and allocation is Rs. 21177.00 crore. There are two components to this head viz. committed liabilities and new schemes. The projected requirement in committed liabilities is Rs. 25461.64 crore and the allocation Rs. 18177.00 crore. The Committee are perplexed at the fact that committed liabilities are obligatory payments for acquisitions etc. and how a shortage of Rs. 7284.64 crore will be adjusted. The Committee were given to understand that likely default of payment is liable to consequent action by vendors.

The projection of budget for new schemes is Rs. 6781.73 crore while the allocation Rs. 3000.00 crore. This is not even 50 per cent of the requirement projected. The Committee are apprised that the capital budget is likely to be utilized by the end of December 2019. To add on to owe of Indian Navy, adequate allocations is required for

maintenance and serviceability of ships, submarines, aircraft and upkeep of ageing infrastructure. The Committee are distressed at the state of affairs with regard to budget being provided to Naval modernization schemes. Therefore, the Committee strongly recommend that allocation of additional funds under Capital Budget should be provided to mitigate critical capability gaps and sustain pace of modernization.

### **Reply of the Government**

Under the Capital Acquisition (Modernization) head, an amount of Rs. 24,226.00 Crore is allocated to Navy in RE 2019-20 i.e. an increase of Rs.3,049 Crore from BE 2019-20 allocations.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 50)**

The Committee were apprised by the representatives of Navy that the Capital budget is likely to be fully utilised by end of December 2019. The Committee take note of conspicuous shortfalls and recommend adequate budgetary provisions to Navy enabling continuation on the modernization trajectory. The Committee acknowledge that efforts are underway to modernise and develop maritime capabilities as per long term perspective plans approved by the Government. There is, therefore, a need for early approvals of key capability and infrastructure cases. Further, sustained budgetary support under Capital and Revenue head should be provided. Keeping in view the declining trend of navy's budget over the years and growth of responsibilities the Committee strongly desire that the Navy's budget share should be enhanced to 18% of the overall defence budget, as it was during the First year of XII<sup>th</sup> Plan.

### **Reply of the Government**

The requirements projected by Navy are forwarded to Ministry of Finance for favourable consideration, however, the allocation received from Ministry of Finance falls short of

projected requirements. Though Navy's allocations appear to be decreasing %age wise vis-à-vis Defence Services Estimates, it is consistently increasing in both Revenue and Capital heads, as can be seen from information furnished below:

**(Rs. in Crore)**

Year	BE (Defence Service Estimates)	Navy (Revenue)	%age share	Navy (Capital)	%age share	Navy (Revenue + Capital)	%age share
2014-15	2,29,000.00	13975.79	6.10	23832.67	10.41	37808.46	16.51
2015-16	2,46,727.00	15525.64	6.29	25003.24	10.13	40528.88	16.43
2016-17	2,49,099.00	17424.79	7.00	22000.09	8.83	39424.88	15.83
2017-18	2,59,261.90	18493.82	7.13	19348.16	7.46	37841.98	14.60
2018-19	2,79,305.32	19571.37	7.01	20848.16	7.46	40419.53	14.47
2019-20	3,05,296.07	22211.71	7.28	23156.43	7.58	45368.14	14.86
2020-21	3,23,053.00	22934.75	7.10	26688.28	8.26	49623.03	15.36

(Figures for Navy include Jt. Staff)

It may be further added that the funds are allocated to Services keeping in view various factors e.g. ceilings conveyed by Ministry of Finance; pending committed liabilities; trend of expenditure; absorption capacity etc. Keeping a certain percentage of Defence budget for a particular Service may not be appropriate as it may be disadvantageous to requirements of other Services.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 51)**

The Committee were concerned to know about the adequacy of the budget for the Sagar Mala project wherein the Government of India has sanctioned 300 plus projects for the Sagar Mala project for the minor and major ports to be set up across the coast of India spanning about 7,000 odd Kilometre. The Committee were apprised that with Sagar Mala kicking in along with ports' capacity to handle more traffic obviously the number of ships calling on Indian ports is bound to increase. That would automatically enhance security concerns as well. The Committee were assured that the Maritime

Capability Perspective Plan, which forms the part of the Long-Term Integrated Perspective Plan (LTIPP), which is approved by the Ministry, caters for the capability required in order to address all such threats. It was further added that there is an urgent need to hike Naval Budget. The Committee opine that certainly Navy needs more money, both for capital segment for asset induction and to pay up committed liabilities and also in the revenue segment because every capital acquisition has got a revenue effect as well. In light of above facts, the Committee recommend that the allocations for Navy should be suitably enhanced to meet the above requirements. The Committee may be apprised about the steps taken in this direction.

### **Reply of the Government**

In BE 2019-20, Navy's allocation under Capital head was Rs. 23,156.43 Crore. This amount is Rs. 26,156.43 Crore in RE 2019-20 i.e. an increase of Rs.3,000 Crore. Further, BE 2020-21 allocation of Navy is Rs. 26,688.28 Crore i.e. Rs. 3,531.85 Crore more than BE 2019-20 allocations. It is further submitted that based on progress of expenditure during the course of next financial year, additional funds will be sought at supplementary/ RE stage.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 52)**

The Committee were given to understand that the Modernisation of Indian Navy(IN) is an ongoing process, which is undertaken in accordance with the Maritime Capability Perspective Plan (MCP) and Long Term Integrated Perspective Plan (LTTIP). LTTIP was approved by Defence Acquisition Council on 02 April 2012. To ensure that Indian Navy units are ready to meet any emergent operational requirement. Review is undertaken regularly to equip forces with the latest weapons, sensors and equipment. These inductions are at various stages of procurement. After gleaning through the papers submitted by the Ministry, the Committee found that in 2011-12 which was last year of 11th plan the actual expenditure incurred by Navy including Joint Staff for modernization was Rs. 18251.87 crore. In the year 2016-17, at the end of the Twelfth Plan the Rs. 18737.01 crore was actually expended for modernization needs of Navy. The Committee take note of the marginal increase in modernization spending after five years which become negligible considering inflationary effect. The Shortfall of funds sometimes also lead to systemic delay in acquisition of critical capabilities. The Committee would like to comment that modernisation and technology up gradation is a continuous process for which adequate budgetary allocation should be made. The Committee may be apprised of the steps taken in this regard.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 53)**

Committee also took note of the corrective steps taken to ensure that modernisation process is not hampered. These include approvals of capital acquisition cases being progressed through collegiate bodies such as Services Capital Acquisition Plan Categorisation Committee (SCAPCC)/ Services Capital Acquisition Plan Categorisation Higher Committee (SCAPCHC)/ Defence Procurement Board (DPB) /Defence Acquisition Council(DAC) to achieve transparency & faster decision making in

procurement process. It was further informed that an indigenous Defence industry would aid in the modernisation of the Defence Forces. Towards this, the Government has taken a number of steps to encourage creating indigenous defence manufacturing infrastructure. While appreciating the efforts being made in speeding up the modernization processes, the Committee wish to state that adequate attention should be given for infusion of requisite funds by the Ministry of Defence and also efficient disposal of budget by Naval Headquarters.

### **Reply of the Government**

Indian Navy(IN) undertakes prioritization of capital acquisition plan in line with the available fiscal resources. This is done to ensure that the resources allotted to the IN are utilized judiciously through prioritization, close monitoring of ongoing projects, and periodic reviews. IN schemes are prioritised in a way so that the most critical capability gaps are addressed in the short term whilst cases with long gestation period are also initiated to prevent degradation of IN's Force levels and the ability to provide Maritime Security to the country.

**2. Budget Utilisation.** With regard to the Committee's comment on efficient disposal of budget by Naval Headquarters, it is submitted that IN has fully utilized the allocations under Capital Budget in the last two FYs as well as the allocations at BE stage in CFY also has been fully utilized as on 31<sup>st</sup> Dec 2019. The details are tabulated below:-

(Rs in Crore)

<b>Financial Year</b>	<b>Budget</b>	<b>Actuals</b>
2017-18	17937.10	18153.07
2018-19	19083.00	19777.37
2019-20	21177.00	21645.38

### **Recommendation (Para No. 54)**

The Committee were enlightened that warship building has matured in the country and Indian Navy has transformed from a 'Buyers Navy' into a 'Builders Navy', with indigenous aircraft carrier, destroyers, stealth frigates, corvettes, submarines and other minor war vessels being produced in the country. The equipment and machinery fitted onboard ships in the three categories of Float, Move and Fight has been indigenised to the extent of ninety per cent, sixty per cent and fifty per cent respectively. The Committee are delighted to find that the Government has taken several measures to make the country self-reliant and promote indigenous development of modern defence hardware. Subsequent to the announcement of 'Make in India' initiative by the Government of India in September 2014 a policy framework was evolved to align the Defence Procurement Procedure with 'Make in India'. It focuses on institutionalising, streamlining and simplifying procedure to give a boost to 'Make in India' initiative of Government of India through indigenous design, development and manufacturing of defence equipment, platforms and systems. Accordingly, a new category of procurement viz. 'Buy {Indian – Indigenous Design, Development and Manufacturing (IDDM)}', has been included which is given the highest priority in procurements. The Committee took note of the fact that the number of cases of buying from Indian vendors has reduced from thirty-four in 2007-08 to thirteen in 2016-17. Although, the cost expended for the same has grown up. During Eleventh Plan Period a sum of Rs. 43296.94 crore was expended on indigenisation and in the Twelfth Plan Period it was Rs. 54,540.93 crore. Further the Committee were updated that seventy per cent of the Modernisation Budget utilised for procurements from indigenous sources in last four years and till now more than 3000 items have been indigenized.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 55)**

The Committee also realized that some cases of naval procurements had been delayed due to limited indigenous capacity and defence industrial base in the country and also limited capability of private shipyards. The Committee while commending the effort being made towards indigenization, wish to urge upon the Ministry of Defence to look into such matter and resolve the hurdles in indigenisation process as this benefits the country in many ways. It generates employment in the country, and check outflow of national resources and also significantly enhances skill base within the country.

## **Reply of the Government**

Indian Navy(IN), has constantly strived towards achieving ‘ Self-Reliance through Indigenization’ and has synchronized the efforts with various flagship schemes of Govt. of India, viz., ‘Make in India’, ‘Technology Development Fund’ and ‘Innovation for Defence Excellence’, in addition to procurement under the ‘Revenue’ route. IN has engaged actively with industries ranging from Major to MSMEs including Start-ups; to encourage their active participation in Indigenization Programmes. In last two years indigenous development cases for Equipment and Systems have been contracted under various schemes amounting to AoN value of Rs. 531 Crore.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 65)**

The Committee expressed concern for the increasing challenges in neighbouring waters and desired to be updated on the efforts being made by Indian side to tackle this. Taking note of the progress of exercise like ‘quad’ which include Navies of USA, Japan and India and Australia, the Committee recommend for more such collaborations and foreign cooperation as the country have considerable investments in the region.

## **Reply of the Government**

India’s Foreign Cooperation initiatives aim to position India as a dependable partner for the IOR littoral nations and emerge as the ‘First Port of Call’ to meet their maritime security needs. Efforts being undertaken by the Ministry of Defence are enumerated in succeeding paragraphs.

2. **Agreements/MoUs.** A number of agreements/ MoUs have been signed by the Friendly Foreign Countries (FFCs) in the region to institutionalize our defence engagements. White shipping information exchange agreement has been signed with 22 countries and is being pursued with 14 more countries. Coastal Surveillance Rader Systems (CSRS) have been set-up in Mauritius, Seychelles, Sri Lanka, Maldives and proposal to install the same have been signed with Myanmar and Bangladesh. The option to set-up CSRS is being progressed with 12 other countries in the region. MoUs on Hydrography has also been concluded with Mauritius, Tanzania, Seychelles, Maldives, Mozambique and proposals are in progress with Kenya, Nigeria, Sri Lanka, Myanmar and Vietnam.

3. **Staff Talks.** Staff Talks/Executive steering group meetings with countries in the region which include Australia, Bangladesh, France, Japan, Malaysia, Maldives, Myanmar, Singapore, South Korea, Sri Lanka, Thailand, UK, USA, Vietnam, Oman, Russia, Indonesia, Israel, South Africa and UAE are also held at the Service levels.

4. **Exercises.** Bilateral Exercises and coordinated patrols are being pursued with many nations in the region to improve interoperability which include France(Varuna), Myanmar (IMNEX), Russia (INDRA), Singapore (SIMBEX), Sri Lanka (SLINEX), UK (Konkan), Vietnam, USA (Malabar), Japal (JIMEX), Bangladesh, Malaysia (Samudra Lakshmana), Australia (AUSINDEX), Indonesia (Samudra Shakti), UAE, Oman (Naseem-AI-Bahr), Saudi(IN-KSAN) and Qatar (Zair Al Badr). Multilateral/ Trilateral exercises are also held which include the ADMM Plus, IBSAMAR (Brazil, South Africa), SITMEX (India, Singapore & Thailand), KAKADU, Cutlass Express, RIMPAC and MILAN. Coordinated patrols are also being conducted with Bangladesh, Indonesia, Myanmar and Thailand apart from other countries in the region.

5. **Capacity Building/Capacity Enhancement.** A range of cooperative constructs to facilitate capability and capacity building have been initiated for the countries in the region. Naval assets have been gifted to countries such as Seychelles, Sri Lanka, Maldives and Mauritius. Professional and quality training is imparted by all the three Services and Coast Guard to a very large number of foreign countries every year which has been the cornerstone of foreign cooperation with IOR littorals. Enhancing training and skill development of personnel from Friendly Foreign Countries through regular programmes in India as well as deputing training teams, including setting up suitable institutions in select countries is accruing significant benefits.

6. **IONS/IORA** IN is steering the Indian Ocean Navel Symposium construct to reinvigorate cooperation in the Indian Ocean Region. Presently, IONS has 24 member countries (Bangladesh, India, Maldives, Pakistan, Seychelles, Sri Lanka, UK, Iran, Oman, Saudi Arabia, UAE, France, Kenya, Mauritius, Mozambique, South Africa, Tanzania, Australia, Indonesia, Malaysia, Myanmar, Singapore, Thailand, Timor-Leste) and 08 observer countries (China, Japan, Germany, Italy, Madagascar, Netherland, Russia, Spain). IN is also actively involed in pursuing India's interest in IORA viz. conducting activity under the Maritime Security and Disaster Risk Management Cluster group, formulation of IORA HADR guidelines and MoU between IFC-IOR and IORA secretariat. Cooperation by the Indian Coast Guard in the field of Pollution Control, Anti – Piracy and Human Trafficking has also been initiated with a number of FFCs.



### **Recommendation (Para Nos. 66 & 67)**

Considering the enhancement in role and responsibilities of Joint Staff which include Cyber security and Electromagnetic spectrum management, Defence museum and memorial as well as ever increasing domain of military intelligence, the Committee opine that Joint Staff shall be provided the requisite funds for carrying out their operational responsibilities. Even during the oral evidence, the Defence Secretary concurred on the additional requirement of funds for Joint Staff. The Committee found that lower allocations would adversely impact the operational as well as administrative functioning of Joint Staff. The Operational impact of lower allocations would affect the Repairs and Refit of ships at Acquisition Negotiations Committee and Procurement of Stores by material Organisation at Port Blair. Annual Maintenance Contract Payment of equipment will be affected and also the upgradation/creation of operational Infrastructure will be hampered. Maintenance of other Military Equipment will also be impaired. Administrative Impact includes maintenance & Repair Works, Tariffs, Military Roads, Furniture's, Special Repairs. This would in turn obstruct training activities of Training Establishments. Also, in future Financial Years Carryover Liabilities would increase. In addition to all this, the modernization activities will also get derailed as funds deficit would certainly delay the impending projects/ Works and raisings of newly Raised Organisations.

The Committee observe that Joint Staff is a growing organisation and its role is critical, particularly from the point of view of intelligence gathering and dissemination. Therefore, it is recommended that necessary funds are provided to them at the stage of supplementary grants.

### **Reply of the Government**

This Ministry is in agreement with the recommendation of the Committee. All efforts will be made to provide adequate funds to meet expenditure and if required, additional funds will be sought at Supplementary/ RE stages in FY 2020-21.

## **CHAPTER II B**

### **OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS, WHICH HAVE BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE GOVERNMENT AND COMMENTED UPON**

#### **Recommendation (Para No.12)**

During the recent study visit of the Standing Committee on Defence to Eastern Sector from 04 to 09 November, 2019, they came across a request for high-tech state – of-the-art cameras for surveillance purposes. The Committee were intimated that fifteen to sixteen such cameras were required for the posts over there. During oral evidence, the Committee were apprised by the representatives of Ministry of Defence that they have received request for surveillance equipment. It was also found that the said requirement is not only at Eastern Command but all across the northern borders. The request is being undertaken in two ways. One is a central procurement which takes a little longer but meets the overall requirement. To meet the immediate operational requirement, there is Army Commanders Special Financial Powers Fund under which the Army Commanders are empowered by such operationally necessary equipment to fill in the gap till such time that the central procurement materializes. The Committee note that despite special powers bestowed upon Army Commanders, surveillance equipments are not installed at the required places. It is desired that the immediate requirement for surveillance equipment at Eastern Command and northern borders including Nathu La Post must be fulfilled at the earliest. Also, complete requirement of the surveillance equipment must be attended to through central procurement as the borders areas are sensitive in nature. The Committee emphasize that no stones shall be left unturned in order to develop a fool proof border line.

#### **Reply of the Government**

Proposals to augment/address voids in surveillance grid along the LAC/IB as per appreciated operational necessity are projected by forward deployed field formations and these are holistically reviewed at Theatre Level.

2. While operational requirement is the primary driver to determine procurement, it is highlighted that proposals from forward deployed formations are analysed considering the terrain and geography, cost benefit analysis, availability of existing inventory of equipment and proposals being pursued by other stake holders to avoid duplicity, and obviate future challenges to equipment inventory management, are amongst the other factors analysed before procurement of equipment is undertaken.

Accordingly, the different types of equipment that are capable of carrying out surveillance including UAVs, satellite imageries unmanned sensors, radars and other equipment with capabilities of thermal imaging as well as infra-red systems, so as to provide all weather surveillance, are procured.

3. Post operational endorsement of requirement, technical parameters and desired operational capabilities of devices (GSQR) are evolved through a Board of Officers to meet the identified operational voids. Specific items and quantities are then taken up for procurement through funds like Army Commander's Special Financial Power (ACSFP).

4. Currently, the following proposals for procurement of surveillance devices are in the GSQR evolution stage under ACSFP in Financial Year 2019-20:-

<b>Equipment</b>	<b>Endorsed Projects</b>
Spotter Scope With Integrated Camera	77
Long Distance Day/Night PTZ Camera	75

5. The projected requirement of a 'Fog Camera' by the Formation during the subjects visit has capability which is similar to a LORROS. Further, with a projected cost of approximately Rs. 23,72,500/- per item and with indigenous systems also under production by DRDO and private industry, who have also displayed potential to manufacture such equipment, the proposed requirement is withheld for the time being, because of other means of surveillance equipment, presently available with forward deployed formations. In order to supplement the human resources, effort is on to develop all weather, day and night capability, which will meet the future requirements, with latest technology. The same will hence be considered after integration of equipment proposals currently under progress and fresh review of operational requirement thereon.

*(For comments please see para no. 7 of the chapter-I of the Report)*

### **Recommendation (Para No. 13)**

In course of the above mentioned study visit of the Committee, they were updated about discrepancies in the allowances paid to the personnel of Central and state Governments, such as the local police in the Gangtok region. The alleged discrepancy ranged up to the level of four or five times in the allowances. The Committee took serious note of the matter. During oral evidence, the representatives of

Army deposed before the Committee that various anomalies in allowances have been taken up and the endeavour is to deliver due allowances to all jawans facing hardship. Parity is tried to be

maintained between troops which are deployed at similar areas. In this regard, further the Committee were assured that the matter will be looked into in consultation with Ministry of Defence and the exact figures on the allowances would be furnished. However, the Committee were not furnished the exact figures on the allowances till the time of drafting of this Report. The Committee recommend that Ministry and Army shall resolve the matter at the earliest and befitting allowances shall be paid to the soldiers in parity with other departments so that the morale of the deployed personnel is not dented.

### **Reply to the Government**

As per Seventh Central Pay Commission(CPC) recommendations, allowances related to risk and hardship have been subsumed in different cells of Risk and Hardship Matrix. The matrix is divided into 9 cells, based on Low, Medium and High risk juxtaposed with Low, Medium and High hardship. One extra cell, has been added to the top: RH Max to include Siachen Allowance. The aforementioned recommendations of the 7<sup>th</sup> CPC were accepted by the Government with some modifications vide Ministry of Finance Resolution dated 06.07.2017. Subsequently, MoD order dated 18.09.2017 was issued to implement aforementioned decision of the Government. Allowances to Uniform services are based on their conditions of services. Some of these are at par with the allowances given to Central Armed Police Forces, Border Security Force, etc.

Further, the seventh CPC has recommended that a joint committee of Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Defence should revisit the present classification of places, and future categorizations should also be done as a joint exercise for places where CAPFs are posted. Subsequently the Government decided that classification of Field areas for Defence forces shall be examined by Ministry of Defence and for CAPFs by Ministry of Home Affairs.

In pursuance of the aforementioned decision of the Government, a Committee has been constituted in Ministry of Defence vide order dated 22.03.2019 to review

classification of field areas for Risk and Hardship Allowance to Defence Service Personnel. The first meeting of the said Committee was held on 9.4.2019.

It is pertinent to mention here that Defence Forces are a distinct and unique class in its own and that they are different from other Uniform Services in the sense that the terms & conditions of service, the scheme of selection and appointment, the policy of promotions and Ranks, etc. are different from other Services.

*(For comments please see para no. 10 of the chapter-I of the Report)*

### **Recommendation (Para No. 32)**

With regard to the trainer Aircraft held by IAF, the Committee were intimated that the existing strength of trainer aircraft is 260 as against the sanctioned strength of 388. Out of 260, 42 Kiran Mk II are not in use anymore. So they are left with only 218 trainer aircraft. Currently the trainer aircraft held in kitty of Air Force include Basic Trainer Aircraft (BTA), Intermediate Jet Trainer (IJT), Advanced Jet Trainer (AJT). Simulators have also been acquired for the Basic Trainer Aircraft and Advance Jet Trainer aircraft. Presently, IAF has two Fixed Base Full mission Simulators (FBFMS), three Cockpit Procedure Trainers (CPTs) and one Avionics Part Task Trainer (APTT) along with associated equipment and infrastructure for the BTA. Similarly for AJT, three CPTs, three APTTs and two FTDs (Flight Training Display) are installed for providing simulator training. The procurement of simulators is built into the contracts of all aircraft that the Indian Air Force is now procuring. The Committee are further updated on the plan to reduce the paucity in number of trainer aircraft. Case for procurement of 38 additional Basic Trainer Aircraft under the 'Option Clause' was being processed. However, the same has been deferred for one year. A case for procurement of 20 additional Advanced Jet Trainer aircraft from Hindustan Aeronautics Limited is currently at the Contract Negotiation Stage. Design and Development (D&D) of HTT-40 aircraft is under progress at HAL, Bangalore. HAL has indicated that the development of HTT-40 is expected to be completed by Dec 2019. The procurement of HTT- 40 will be initiated after successful development of aircraft.

### **Reply of the Government**

Based on the Detailed Project Report (DPR) for design & development of a basic Turbo prop trainer (HTT 40), HAL Board in 2013 approved the design and development

of HTT-40 with its own internal funds. The full scale development involving detail design and procurement could be started only after Board sanction.

The two developed prototypes have so far made about 400 sorties consisting of flights for systems certification, performance evaluation and handling including stall/spins. Hot weather and sea level trials were also carried out for systems certification. All the ground tests required during design and development and fatigue tests of landings gears are also completed. The aircraft meets all the specified system and performance requirements as per the requirement of Indian Air Force.

HTT-40 also demonstrated additional capability like running change over (Flight crew change without switching off the engine) and hot refueling (refueling without switching off engine), features that are generally not available in contemporary trainers.

**Stall/Spin:** The aircraft's stall characteristics were assessed and are termed classical and fit for service induction. The aircraft has also demonstrated its ability to enter, sustain 6 turn spins and recover using conventional controls. Close to 200 spins were carried out between the two prototype aircraft thereby proving the consistency and repeatability of its spin characteristics. Flight trials for full spin qualification are under progress.

In order to reduce the effort required during User Evaluation Trials (UET), a team of test pilots from Aircraft System Testing Establishment (ASTE) are deputed for UATT (User Assisted Technical Trials). ASTE pilots have flown sorties for assessing cockpit ergonomics, performance and handling including stall.

Top officials of IAF have also undertaken sorties on HTT-40 and have given positive feedbacks.

HTT-40 is undergoing final spin refinements to cover all the possible phases of spin inputs including control mishandling etc for the final certification of the aircraft. It may be noted that the aircraft has to be certified against the Air Staff Requirement (ASR) to be issued by Air HQ post accord of Acceptance of Necessity (AoN). With that aircraft will

be offered for User Evaluation Trials (UET) as per the Defence Procurement Procedure (DPP) 2016 guidelines. The initial date for UET was given as June 2020. However, this has now been shifted to 15<sup>th</sup> Sep 2020 due to the lock down impact during which there was no flying undertaken for around 2 months.

The IAF had sought extensive details of Rough Order of Magnitude (ROM) costs of series production aircraft (Order quantity 70) along with simulators, training aids and ground support/handling equipments and the same have been provided in order to process the AoN approval.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 34)**

The Committee observe that trainer aircraft is extremely critical from the point of view of safety of Indian Air Force pilots. Therefore, there should be no tolerance of any compromise in training module and unavailability of trainer aircraft must be taken seriously. The Government should work towards filling the requirement of trainer aircraft at the earliest.

### **Reply of the Government**

No compromise is being made in imparting quality training. IAF has adopted certain changes in flying training syllabus to make training more effective. The learning curve has also been made steeper to weed out weaker pilots before they are posted to operational units. Simulators are being utilised effectively to make trainees more confident in handling modern aircraft. Seventy five Basic Trainer Aircraft have already been procured. A case for procurement of indigenous Basic Trainer Aircraft from HAL has been initiated.

*(For comments on recommendations contained in para nos. 32&34 please see para no. 13 of chapter-I of the Report)*

### **Recommendation (Para No. 35)**

With regard to Transport Planes and Helicopters, it was brought to the knowledge of the Committee that presently, there are some shortages. In some cases, depending on the condition and utilisation of the fleet, intensive life extension studies are conducted and the life span of the air craft extended. No aircraft which has

completed its operational life is in use with the IAF. The Committee note that there is no remarkable dearth of transport planes and helicopters as per the sanctioned strength. The Ministry shall endeavour to fill the small gaps that exist. The Committee also desire that a periodic revision of sanctioned strength should be taken up in pursuance with the ever-increasing role and responsibilities of Air Force.

### **Reply of the Government**

The modernisation of the armed forces is an ongoing process and is executed in consonance with the roadmap laid down in the Long Term Integrated Perspective Plan (LTIPP). The IAF undertakes its Capital procurement following Defence Procurement Procedure as per the capabilities defined in the LTIPP. The LTIPP is further sub divided into Services Capital Acquisition Plan (SCAP) and Annual Acquisition Plan (AAP). A periodic revision of sanctioned strength of transport aircraft and helicopters is regularly taken up in pursuance with the ever-increasing role and responsibilities of Air Force with the endeavour to fill the small existing gaps. Procurement of C-295 Aircraft (56 nos) is in progress.

*(For comments please see para no. 16 of the chapter-I of the Report)*

### **Recommendation (Para Nos. 40-43)**

17. The Committee had recommended as under:-

'The Committee were informed that the Government sanctioned Establishment and Strength of officers and airmen (except Medical & Dental branch) in Indian Air Force, as on 01 October 2019. In case of officers, the sanctioning is for 12,628 while the held strength is 12,159. There is a shortage of 469 officers. The Ministry of Defence intimated that shortage of 469 officers is a variable figure which keeps fluctuating depending on 79 Commissioning cycle, premature separation of officers etc. The induction plans have been revamped so as to gradually bring the strength at par with the sanctioned establishment. In addition, due to robust cadre management planning and implementation, there is likely to be no shortage of officers in the Indian Air Force in due course. The Committee are happy to note the efforts being made to mitigate the deficiency in officer cadre of Air force and wish that the shortfall is minimised to the maximum extent in near future. The Committee may be apprised about the progress made in this regard.

41. In respect of Airmen, the sanctioning is for 142917 posts while the existing strength is 129447, hence a shortfall of 13474. In this connection, the



Committee were apprised that 12,739 trainees are undergoing training at various training institutes. In case of airmen, manpower review is undertaken on annual basis. To reduce the deficiency, improvements in training infrastructure have been carried out to accommodate increased number of trainees and available resources (infrastructure and manpower) are being utilised efficiently to support enhanced induction. Induction in airmen cadre was 5000 per annum till 2015. This has been gradually increased to 6,800 from January 2018. The induction has been further increased to 7,600 airmen each year from July 2019 onwards. In view of this, it is expected that Indian Air Force will be able to bring up the strength at par with the authorized establishment in about 5-6 years. Shortages are being addressed in a staggered manner to ensure a favourable HR environment in the long run and to streamline wastages on account of discharge/superannuation. The Committee take note of various measures being taken by Air Force and desire that induction is carried out in a time bound manner under intimation to them.

42. With regard to training of pilots the Committee found that Air force had been following three aircraft type training pattern. However, due to non-induction of intermediate jet trainer which was being developed by HAL, the two aircraft training pattern started with effect from July 2015 as a pilot project. The Ministry of Defence apprised that the performance of trainees who have undergone this training pattern has been good. The same is planned to be implemented after the phasing out of Kiran aircraft which is the Intermediate Jet Trainer (IJT) available with Air Force. The Committee opines that adequate training of the manpower is inevitable need. This becomes even more crucial in view of the safety of lives of pilots and aircrew involved. There should be no compromise in training of our pilots so that a healthy pilot cockpit ratio is maintained by Indian Air Force. 43. The Committee were keen to be apprised on timeline of the training programme of first batch of Officers and technicians which is underway with the French Air Force on Rafale. It was brought their knowledge that advanced training of IAF personnel was conducted by the French Air Force (FAF) and commenced from Sep 2018 for one IAF pilot, one Aeronautical Engineer (AE) officer and six technicians. Two additional pilots joined the advanced training in France from March 19. This team has completed the advanced training phase and commenced training on Indian Rafale aircraft from 30 September 2019. The Committee congratulate the Indian Air force for achieving this feat and desire that all the training and induction programme of Rafale progresses as per stipulated timelines. The Committee hopes to soon witness Rafale flying in Indian skies by Indian Air Force.'

18. The Ministry in its Action Taken Reply has stated as under :-

'The Government sanctioned Establishment and Strength of officers (except Medical & Dental branch) in the IAF, as on **01 Jan 2020**, is as follows:-

<b>Establishment</b>	<b>Strength</b>
12657	12232

Difference of **425** is a variable figure which keeps fluctuating depending on commissioning cycle, premature separation of officers etc. The inductions are planned so as to gradually bring the strength at par with the sanctioned establishment.'

As on 01 Jan 2020, strength of airmen in IAF is **1,32,558** against an establishment of **1,42,917** leading to a deficiency of **10,359**. Additionally, **12,627 trainees** are undergoing training at various training Institutes. Review of requirement of manpower is undertaken on annual basis. To reduce the deficiency, improvements in training infrastructure have been carried out to accommodate increased number of trainees. Further, available resources (infrastructure and manpower) are being utilised efficiently to support enhanced induction. Till 2015, Induction in airmen cadre was 5000 per annum which has been gradually increased to 6800 from Jan 2018. The induction has been increased to 7600 airmen each year from July, 2019 onwards. In view of this, it is expected that IAF will be able to bring up the strength at par with the authorized establishment in about 5-6 years. Shortages are being addressed in a staggered manner to ensure a favourable HR environment in the long run and to streamline wastages on account of discharge/superannuation.

Induction of Airmen into Indian Air Force is through Scheduled Tests and Recruitment Rallies. Enrollment process of selected candidates are conducted twice in a year (Jan & July each year). No vacancy remains vacant for more than two years since induction is an ongoing as well as time bound process and is being carried out strictly as per the timelines specified.

No compromise is being made in imparting quality training. IAF has adopted certain changes in flying training syllabus to make training more effective. The learning curve has also been made steeper to weed out weaker pilots before they are posted to operational units. Simulators are being utilised effectively to make trainees more confident in handling modern aircraft.

Presently shortage of Kiran aircraft, Intermediate Jet Trainer (IJT) is due to obsolescence and ageing issues. These aircraft are planned to be phased out by 2025-26. HAL made IJT, HTT-36 D&D aircraft project to replace Kiran aircraft is running behind schedule. The procurement of HAL HJT-36 has been delinked and IAF has initiated the process to acquire a new trainer aircraft to replace the Kiran Aircraft.

An Inter-Governmental Agreement was signed between the Government of India and the Government of France on 23 Sep 16 for the procurement of 36

Rafale aircraft. Air Force Station Ambala and Air Force Station Hasimara are designated as two Rafale Main Operating Bases (MOBs). The first aircraft has been handed over on 19 Sep 19 in France with the formal induction ceremony on 08 Oct 19 (87<sup>th</sup> Air Force Day) in France. Total four Rafale aircraft have been accepted by Indian Air Force and are being utilised for training of IAF Pilots and Ground crew at OEM premises in France. The induction of all 36 aircraft is planned to be completed by April, 2022.'

*(For comments on recommendations contained in para nos. 40-43, please see para no. 19 of the chapter-I of the Report)*

### **Recommendation (Para No. 57)**

The Committee are apprised that Indian Navy acquisitions are planned in accordance with the Maritime Capability Perspective Plan (MCPP 2012-27). Further, this has been subsumed in the Long Term Integrated Perspective Plan (LTIPP 2012-27) of the Services and the XIIth Plan. Acquisition of defence equipment is undertaken in accordance with the Defence Procurement Procedure (DPP). Shortfalls are there in Aircraft Carriers, Mine Counter Measure Vessels (MCMVs), Landing Platform Docks (LPDs), Fleet Support Ships (FSSs), submarines, aircraft and helicopters. Cases for induction are being progressed to meet capability shortfall. Currently, Acceptance of Necessity is given for 41 ships and six submarines, the cases for which are at various stages of acquisition. There is a need to accord impetus for replacement of ageing ships submarines, planes and helicopters. This is being done by induction of modern surface ships like Indigenous aircraft carrier, four Destroyers of Project 15B and seven Frigates of Project 17A. There is a severe capability gap of Mine Counter Measure Vessels, Landing Platform Docks (LPDs) for expeditionary operations, survey ships and Diving Support Vessels. Induction of 12 new Mine Counter Measure Vessels, four Landing Platform Docks, four survey vessels and two Diving support ships are being progressed to meet these capability shortfalls. The Committee would like to have a detailed updation note on the progress made in acquisition of ships, submarines, planes and helicopters in the Action Taken Replies.

## **Reply of the Government**

Shipbuilding projects i.e Project 28, Project 15B, Project 71, Project 17A and Survey Vessels (Large) at various Indian Shipyards are at various stages of implementation.

**Project 75.** Induction of two conventional submarines taken place viz. INS Kalvari (delivered to IN on 21<sup>st</sup> Sep 2017 and commissioned on 14<sup>th</sup> Dec 2017) and INS Khanderi (delivered to IN on 19<sup>th</sup> Sep 2019 and Commissioned on 28<sup>th</sup> Sep 2019). The other submarines are at various stages of construction.

**Diving Support Vessels.** Ordering of steel for both the ships has been completed and keel laying for the first vessel was held on 28<sup>th</sup> Dec 2019. Block Construction is in progress inside M/s HSL premises. Ordering of critical equipment required for launching of the ship (Main Engine, Propellers, Das, Thrusters etc) is being progressed by the shipyard on fast track.

**Aircraft.** Deliveries of Dornier, Chetak and ALH are scheduled between January 2019 to November, 2021.

### **Recommendation (Para No. 58)**

It was also found that certain delays had been witnessed in key acquisitions such as vessels and aircraft. Various reasons including delays in Research & Development projects, slippages by Ordnance Factories and vigilance ban on defence companies were cited for the said delays. The Committee urge the Ministry of Defence to look into such slippages and ensure highest level of transparency and probity, whilst achieving timely induction of planned capability. Time and cost overruns deprive Navy from achieving critical capabilities. This also puts extra burden on the exchequer.

## **Reply of the Government**

Reason for slippages/ delays in acquisition of major warships are multifarious. Some of them are mentioned below:-

(a) **Warship Complexities.** Warships are complex, weapon-intensive platforms that are built in small numbers and cannot be prototyped for construction like cars, tanks and aircraft. A weapon-intensive warship is an amalgamation of diverse technologies including Indigenous, Western, Russian and Israeli origin. The need to cater for obsolescence management, i.e. the need to be contemporary at the time of induction of platform demands fitment of developmental systems/ technology leading to telescopic design & construction with the likelihood of project delays.

(b) **Construction Methodology.** The design is usually undertaken in parallel with construction for platform-level integration of new technologies to mitigate constantly evolving threat scenario in war-fighting. This has inherent challenges with consequent uncertainties. Therefore, because of inherent complexities and uncertainties in shipbuilding, there are special provisions in Defence Procurement Procedures (DPP) with a chapter dedicated to shipbuilding.

(c) **Dependence on Foreign OEMs.** Dependence on foreign OEMs for cutting edge technologies, export regulations, long lead time for IGA conclusion and global sanctions invoked on certain countries are additional factors that could lead to slippages.

(d) **Indigenisation.** All-round emphasis is being placed on indigenisation of equipment manufacture and shipbuilding. While indigenisation is critical to ensure self-reliance and avoid technology/ equipment/ spares support denial in times of hostility, the process can itself cause undue delay in the project schedule. Indigenisation often leads to protracted negotiations with the Transfer of Technology (ToT) firm and teething delays in first time manufacture at Indian firms.

*(For comments on the recommendations contained in para nos. 57&58 please see para no. 22 of the chapter-I of the Report)*

### **Recommendation (Para No. 68)**

The Committee found that the project for Defence University is under consideration. With regard to the physical progress, it was updated by the representatives of Ministry of Defence that the land had been identified and boundary wall erected. The approval of the Indian Defence University is under consideration at highest level and after its approval the integration process will be started. The Committee appreciate the efforts in this regard and wish to be updated on the progress in Action Taken Replies.

### **Reply of the Government**

Post inter-ministerial consultation, advance copies of Cabinet Note on IDU Bill, 2017 has been forwarded to Cabinet Secretariat. The IDU Bill 2017 is pending for approval by Cabinet.

*(For comments please see para no. 25 of the chapter-I of the Report)*

### **Recommendation (Para No. 69)**

“Subsequent to successful implementation of the project for war memorial, the Committee desired to be updated on the status of defence museum. In this regard, representatives of joint staff intimated the Committee that the plan for defence museum is in progress. The Committee hail the idea of defence museum and wish that it soon sees the light of the day.”

### **Reply of the government**

The Cabinet approved construction of National War Museum in Oct 2015. MoHUA allotted 14.173 acres of land at Princes Park for construction of National War Museum in Dec 2016. Govt. Sanction Letter (GSL) for the project was issued on 18 Dec 2015. An Empowered Apex Steering Committee (EASC) and a Project

Management Team (PMT) were constituted by the Cabinet with mandate to take all key decisions and oversee execution from conception stage to completion.

CPWD has been entrusted to identify a suitable architectural design and execute the work for construction of the National War Museum. In this connection, it has been directed to initiate and complete the construction of the National War Museum by December 2022.

*(For comments please see para no. 28 of the chapter-I of the Report)*

**CHAPTER III**

**OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS, WHICH THE COMMITTEE DO NOT DESIRE TO  
PURSUE IN VIEW OF THE REPLIES RECEIVED FROM THE GOVERNMENT**

-Nil-



## **CHAPTER IV**

**OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS, IN RESPECT OF WHICH REPLIES OF THE GOVERNMENT HAVE NOT BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE COMMITTEE AND WHICH REQUIRE REITERATION**

-Nil-

## CHAPTER V

### OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS, IN RESPECT OF WHICH GOVERNMENT HAVE FURNISHED INTERIM REPLIES

-Nil-

New Delhi;  
9 February, 2021  
20 Magha, 1942 (Saka)

Jual Oram,  
Chairperson,  
Standing Committee on Defence

## APPENDIX I

### STANDING COMMITTEE ON DEFENCE (2020-21)

#### MINUTES OF THE THIRD SITTING OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON DEFENCE (2020-21)

The Committee sat on Tuesday, the 9<sup>th</sup> February, 2021 from 1530 hrs. to 1600 hrs. in Committee Room No. 2, Block A, Extension to Parliament House Annexe (EPHA), New Delhi.

#### PRESENT

**Shri Jual Oram** - **Chairperson**

#### MEMBERS

##### Lok Sabha

2. Kunwar Danish Ali
3. Shri Ajay Bhatt
4. Shri Nitesh Ganga Deb
5. Shri Annasaheb Shankar Jolle
6. Choudhary Mehboob Ali Kaiser
7. Smt. (Dr.) Rajashree Mallick
8. Dr. T.R. Paarivendhar
9. Shri Kapil Moreshwar Patil
10. Shri Jugal Kishore Sharma
11. Shri Prathap Simha
12. Shri Brijendra Singh
13. Shri Durga Das Uikey

##### Rajya Sabha

14. Dr. Ashok Bajpai
15. Shri V. Lakshmikantha Rao
16. Shri Sanjay Raut
17. Shri Kamakhya Prasad Tasa
18. Dr. Sudhanshu Trivedi
19. Lt. Gen. Dr. D. P. Vats (Retd.)

**SECRETARIAT**

1. Smt. Kalpana Sharma - Additional Secretary
2. Dr. Sanjeev Sharma - Director
3. Shri Rahul Singh - Deputy Secretary

2. At the outset, the Chairperson welcomed the Members of the Committee and informed them about the agenda for the Sitting. The Committee then took up for consideration the following draft Action Taken Reports:-

- i. **Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Twenty-third Report (16<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha) of the Standing Committee on Defence on the subject 'Proxy and Postal Voting by Defence Services Personnel in General Elections an Evaluation';**
- ii. **Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Fiftieth Report (16<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha) of the Standing Committee on Defence on the subject 'Provision of all weather road connectivity under Border Roads Organisation (BRO) and other agencies up to International Borders as well as the strategic areas including approach roads-an appraisal';**
- iii. **Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the First Report (17<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha) on Demands for Grants of the Ministry of Defence for the year 2019-20 on 'General Defence Budget, Border Roads Organisation, Indian Coast Guard, Military Engineer Services, Directorate General Defence Estates, Defence Public Sector Undertakings, Canteen Stores Department, Welfare of Ex-Servicemen, Ex-Servicemen Contributory Health Scheme, Defence Pensions, Sainik Schools (Demand Nos. 18 and 21)';**
- iv. **Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Second Report (17<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha) on Demands for Grants of the Ministry of Defence for the year 2019-20 on 'Army, Navy, Air Force and Joint Staff (Demand Nos. 19 and 20)';**
- v. **Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Fourth Report (17<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha) on Demands for Grants of the Ministry of Defence for the year 2019-20 on 'Ordnance Factories, Defence Research and Development Organisation, Directorate General of Quality Assurance and National Cadet Corps (Demand No. 19 and 20)';**
- vi. **Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Fifth Report (17<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha) on Demands for Grants of**

**the Ministry of Defence for the year 2020-21 on ‘General Defence Budget, Border Roads Organisation, Indian Coast Guard, Military Engineer Services, Directorate General Defence Estates, Defence Public Sector Undertakings, Canteen Stores Department, Welfare of Ex-Servicemen, Ex-Servicemen Contributory Health Scheme, Defence Pensions, Sainik Schools (Demand Nos. 18, 19, 20 and 21)’;**

- vii. Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Sixth Report (17<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha) on Demands for Grants of the Ministry of Defence for the year 2020-21 on ‘Army, Navy, Air Force and Joint Staff (Demand Nos. 19 and 20)’; and**
- viii. Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Eighth Report (17<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha) on Demands for Grants of the Ministry of Defence for the year 2020-21 on ‘Ordnance Factories, Defence Research and Development Organisation, Directorate General of Quality Assurance and National Cadet Corps (Demand Nos. 19 and 20)’.**

3. After some deliberations, the Committee adopted the above reports without any modifications.

4. The Committee, then, authorized the Chairperson to finalise the above draft Reports and present the same to the House on a date convenient to him.

5. \*\*\*\*\*Does not pertain to the Reports\*\*\*\*\*

The Committee then adjourned.

\*\*\*\*\*

## APPENDIX II

ANALYSIS OF THE ACTION TAKEN BY THE GOVERNMENT ON THE OBSERVATIONS/ RECOMMENDATIONS CONTAINED IN THE SECOND REPORT OF STANDING COMMITTEE ON DEFENCE (SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA) ON 'DEMANDS FOR GRANTS OF THE MINISTRY OF DEFENCE FOR THE YEAR 2018-19 ON ARMY, NAVY, AIR FORCE AND JOINT STAFF(DEMAND NO. 20)'

1.Total number of recommendations 69

2. Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by the Government (please see Chapter II):

Para Nos. 1-69

Total : 69

Percentage:100 %

3. Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies received from the Government (please see Chapter III):

Total : 00

Percentage: -

4.Recommendations/Observations in respect of which replies of Government have not been accepted by the Committee which require reiteration and commented upon ( please see Chapter IV):

Total : 00

Percentage: -

5.Recommendations/Observations in respect of which Government have furnished interim replies (please see Chapter V):

Total : 00

Percentage: -