

(1900/RP/RPS)

**माननीय अध्यक्ष :** आप किसी को इजाजत नहीं दे सकते हैं, यह अधिकार मेरा है। प्लीज, बैठ जाइए।  
... (व्यवधान)

**माननीय अध्यक्ष :** क्या वे आसन को इजाजत दे सकते हैं? यह अधिकार आसन का है कि किसको इजाजत देनी है या किसको इजाजत नहीं देनी है।  
राहुल गांधी जी, आप बोलिए।

... (व्यवधान)

**माननीय अध्यक्ष :** आप बैठ जाइए। मैं आपको मौका दूंगा।  
... (व्यवधान)

**माननीय अध्यक्ष :** राहुल गांधी जी, आप बोलिए।  
... (व्यवधान)

**माननीय अध्यक्ष :** माननीय सदस्य, आप बैठिए, मैं आपको बाद में मौका दूंगा। राहुल गांधी जी, आप बोलिए।  
... (व्यवधान)

SHRI RAHUL GANDHI (WAYANAD): Speaker, Sir, so this confused ideology, this confused understanding of the nation of India is playing havoc with this country. I will give you examples. The Judiciary, the Election Commission and the Pegasus are the instruments of ... (*Expunged as ordered by the Chair*) the voice of the Union of States.... (*Interruptions*) When you apply Pegasus on an Indian politician, when the ... (*Expunged as ordered by the Chair*) personally goes to Israel and authorises the use of Pegasus in India, he is attacking the people of Tamil Nadu, he is attacking the people of Assam, he is attacking the people of Kerala; and he is attacking the people of Bengal... ... (*Interruptions*)

**डॉ. निशिकांत दुबे (गोड्डा):** अध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरा प्वाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर है।... (व्यवधान)

**माननीय अध्यक्ष :** एक मिनट रुकिए। प्वाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर क्या है? रूल बोलिए।

**डॉ. निशिकांत दुबे (गोड्डा):** रूल 352 (1)।

अध्यक्ष महोदय, रूल 352 (1) कहता है:

“A member while speaking shall not—

(i) refer to any matter of fact on which a judicial decision is pending;”

यह मामला सुप्रीम कोर्ट में पेंडिंग है और यदि इनको सुप्रीम कोर्ट पर विश्वास है, कोर्ट पर विश्वास है तो ये अपना फोन जमा करें। पहले उसकी इनक्वायरी में शामिल हों, क्योंकि इनका नाम भी पेगासस मैटर में है, जिसके बारे में वे कह रहे हैं। इसलिए वे पेगासस का नाम नहीं ले सकते हैं। ये कोऑपरेट नहीं कर रहे हैं।

SHRI RAHUL GANDHI (WAYANAD): So, what is happening is that a particular organisation has captured the institutional framework of the country and is attacking the voice of the different States of this country. My fear is that you will get a reaction from that voice. My fear is that this attack that you are carrying out on the institutional framework of this country is going to get a response from the Union of States. You are fiddling, I understand this. You might not appreciate it but my great grandfather spent 15 years in jail in building this thing. My grandmother was shot 32 times and my father was blown to bits. So, I understand a little bit about what this country is. My blood is being sacrificed not by me but by my great grandfather, by my grandmother and my father for this country. So, I understand what it is and you are fiddling with something very, very dangerous. I am advising you to stop it because if you do not stop, you will create a problem. You have already started creating the problem. The problem is already started in the North East. The problem is already started in Tamil Nadu. It is not visible to you right now.

I will speak about Jammu and Kashmir as it is my third point. What you are fiddling with is extremely dangerous and it demonstrates a complete lack of understanding of history. This evening, please go back and look at all the empires that have ever ruled India. Look at them carefully. You will find that every single one of them is a Union of States. There was a reason Ashoka used to go and put his pillars everywhere.

(1905/NKL/SPS)

It is because it was a Union of States where Ashoka, the great King respected everybody. You are disrespecting everybody. Disrespect me, I do not care; it does not matter to me. But you cannot disrespect the people of this country. ... (*Interruptions*)

Now, I come to the final point, and I think it is one of the more important parts of my speech. Actually, I want to say one other thing. I demand an apology from the hon. Home Minister. This again represents the idea of a Union of States vs. the idea of a King. A few days ago, some political leader – I am not going to name him – came to me from Manipur, and he was very agitated. I spoke to him and asked “Why are you agitated, my brother?” He said, “Rahulji, I have never felt as insulted as I had a few days ago.”

I asked him the reason. He said, "Rahulji, a delegation of Manipuri political leaders, senior leaders, went to see the Home Minister. Outside his house, we were told to take off our shoes. When we went inside his room, we found that the hon. Home Minister was wearing his *chappals*." What does this mean? What exactly does this mean? Why is it that in the hon. Home Minister's house, the hon. Home Minister can wear *chappals* but a delegation of Manipuri politicians cannot do so? ... (*Interruptions*) What does this mean? ... (*Interruptions*)

**श्री जनार्दन सिंह सिग्ग्रीवाल (महाराजगंज) :** आप गलत बोल रहे हैं। ... (व्यवधान)

**श्री राहुल गांधी (वयनाड) :** मैं गलत नहीं बोल रहा हूँ। स्पीकर सर, मैं आपको फोटो दिखा दूंगा। ... (व्यवधान) मैंने उस व्यक्ति से बोला कि आप गलत बोल रहे हैं तो उसने कहा कि राहुल जी मैं आपको फोटो देता हूँ और उसने मुझे फोटो दी। This is not the way to deal with the people of India. ... (*Interruptions*)

Anyway, let me come to my final and the most important point. ... (*Interruptions*) We are sitting. ... (*Interruptions*)

**श्री प्रवेश साहिब सिंह वर्मा (पश्चिमी दिल्ली) :** यह हमारी संस्कृति है।

**श्री राहुल गांधी (वयनाड) :** संस्कृति यह होती है कि वे भी जूते उतारें और आप भी उतारें। संस्कृति यह नहीं होती है कि वे जूते उतारें और आप नहीं उतारें। पता नहीं यह आपकी कौन सी संस्कृति है। ... (व्यवधान) Let me finish my point. ... (*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF COMMERCE AND INDUSTRY, MINISTER OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS, FOOD AND PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION AND MINISTER OF TEXTILES (SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL): It is a very ridiculous argument. ...

(*Interruptions*) It has touched the religious sensibility ... (*Interruptions*) You have touched the religious sensibilities of all our people. ... (*Interruptions*) क्या इस सदन के अंदर ये हमारी धार्मिक परंपराओं पर ऐसी टिप्पणियां कर सकते हैं? ... (व्यवधान) ये भारत के धर्म के ऊपर अटैक कर रहे हैं, भारत की धार्मिक परंपराओं पर अटैक कर रहे हैं। यह हम सबकी धार्मिक परंपराओं के ऊपर आघात है।

**माननीय अध्यक्ष :** मैं यह चैक कर लूंगा।

... (व्यवधान)

**श्री पीयूष गोयल :** हमारे घर में भी यही परिस्थिति है।

**माननीय अध्यक्ष :** आप सभी क्यों खड़े हो जाते हो? यह क्या तरीका है?

... (व्यवधान)

SHRI RAHUL GANDHI (WAYANAD): Hon. Speaker Sir, it reflects a mentality, a sense that 'I am bigger than you; you are nobody, I am everybody, and that is why, I will wear my shoes, and you will not.' ... (*Interruptions*)

Anyway, I go back to my main point and the final most important point. My understanding is that the RSS and the BJP are playing with the foundations of our country and they are weakening the foundations of our country. ... *(Interruptions)* They are weakening the links between our people. They are weakening the links between our languages. ... *(Interruptions)* They have further weakened the country by ensuring that not a single Indian youngster can get a job. ... *(Interruptions)* So, today, unlike a decade ago, fifteen years ago, India is weak. Ask yourselves why you were not able to get a guest on Republic Day. Ask yourself that question. ... *(Interruptions)*

(1910/MMN/RAJ)

Do not look surprised. Ask yourselves that question. What is happening is that India today is completely isolated. We are completely isolated and surrounded. We are surrounded in Sri Lanka, Nepal, Burma, Pakistan, Afghanistan and China. Everywhere we are surrounded, and our opponents understand our position. ... *(Interruptions)* Please let me speak because I am saying something very serious. Is that right? I am saying something very serious. Let me say we have been weakened. The conversation between our people is not taking place. Our institutions are under attack and we are completely surrounded.

The Chinese have a very clear vision of what they want to do. They are very, very clear about what they want to do. ... *(Interruptions)* One second, please.

You can ask anybody who understands it. The single biggest strategic goal of India's Foreign Policy has been to keep Pakistan and China separate. This is fundamental for India and what you have done is you have brought them together. ... *(Interruptions)* Today, do not be under any illusion. Do not underestimate the force that is standing in front of you. Do not underestimate the power that stands in front of us. Do not underestimate it. You have brought Pakistan and China together and this is the single biggest crime that you could commit against the people of India. China has a clear vision and I can clearly see without any confusion in my mind that China has a plan. ... *(Interruptions)*

China has a plan. ... *(Interruptions)* I can see without any doubt that the Chinese have a plan. ... *(Interruptions)* We are all nationalists, please. So, let us discuss properly. I can see that China has a clear-cut plan.

The foundations of their plan have been put in place in Doklam and in Ladakh. Do not underestimate what we are facing. This is a very, very serious threat to the Indian nation. ... (*Interruptions*) We have made huge strategic mistakes in Jammu and Kashmir. We have made huge strategic mistakes in our Foreign Policy. If we do not correct those mistakes ... (*Interruptions*)

What are the mistakes? I have just told you that you have brought China and Pakistan together. ... (*Interruptions*) You have brought China and Pakistan together. You have taken the concept of two different fronts and converted it into one unified front. By the way, in case you have not realised it, in case you have not understood what is going on, it is very clear that the Chinese and the Pakistanis are planning. Look at the weapons that they are buying. Look at their activity. Look at the way they are talking. Look at who they are speaking to.

I am clearly stating in the House of Parliament that we have made a massive blunder and we need to make absolutely sure that we can defend ourselves against the Chinese. Please remember what I am saying because the Chinese will act. Remember what I am saying. Remember that you will be responsible for anything that happens. That is why, it is important that as a nation we start this conversation. It is important that as a nation that you listen to what we say because we have experience; we have understanding.

(1915/VR/VB)

You might not think so. But we have people on this side, who understand these things, and have great understanding. Use us. ....(*Interruptions*) I can see that some of you are understanding what I am saying. I am happy. I can see. So, these are the three points I wanted to make today.

The nation is now at risk. The nation is at risk. The nation is at risk from outside. The nation is at risk from inside, and that is a very dangerous place for a nation to be. I do not like it. I am very uncomfortable with my nation, with my beloved country standing where it is standing, completely isolated on the outside, fighting on the inside, institutions captured, States not able to speak to each other. This worries me. It frightens me for my country. That is why I thought it important that I speak today. I know that many of you will just rubbish what I am saying. I understand it. That is what you have been told to do, and I am happy to let you do it. But remember what I said – you are putting this nation, this wonderful nation and its people at huge risk. Stop! Thank you. (ends)

## TEXT OF AMENDMENTS

SHRI N. K. PREMACHANDRAN (KOLLAM): I beg to move:

1. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely: --  
“but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the alleged purchase of Israeli spyware Pegasus by the Government.”
2. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
“but regret that there is no mention in the Address about providing special package for ensuring livelihood to common man affected by Covid-19 crisis.”
3. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
“but regret that there is no mention in the Address about establishing a permanent and effective mechanism for controlling and reducing the prices of petrol, diesel and other petroleum products.”
4. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
“but regret that there is no mention in the Address about fixing the minimum support price of various agricultural products and also to provide legislative backing to minimum support price mechanism.”
5. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
“but regret that there is no mention in the Address about any scheme to provide financial assistance to the dependents of the deceased due to Covid-19.”
6. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
“but regret that there is no mention in the Address about ensuring reasonable rate of flight services for Indians working abroad and protection of their jobs in foreign countries.”
7. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
“but regret that there is no mention in the Address about a special package for rehabilitation of Indians who lost their job abroad due to Covid-19.”
8. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about any special programme for direct cash transfer to poor families facing crisis due to Covid-19."

9. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about special package to protect the cashew industry and workers employed in cashew sector."
10. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about Employees Provident Fund reviving schemes by increasing the minimum pension and implementing the orders of the Court for higher pension on the basis of actual wages."

PROF. SOUGATA RAY (DUM DUM): I beg to move:

11. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about direct cash transfer system to the poor families in crisis due to the Covid-19 pandemic."
12. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about any package to protect the traditional industries of the country."
13. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about any concrete steps to counter the alleged aggression of Chinese Armed Forces in various parts of Arunachal Pradesh."
14. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely: --  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about any concrete steps to check the frequent attacks on SC/ST communities in the country."
15. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about steps to distribute nutritious food among the crores of malnourished children."
16. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about a special package for the state of West Bengal."

**श्री विनायक भाउराव राऊत (रत्नागिरी-सिंधुदुर्ग):** मैं प्रस्ताव करता हूँ:

17. कि प्रस्ताव के अंत में, निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात: -  
"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में देश में बढ़ती बेरोजगारी और रोजगार विहीनता के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है।"
18. कि प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात: -  
"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में चीन द्वारा भारत-चीन सीमा पर कई क्षेत्रों पर कथित अवैध कब्जे के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है।"
110. कि प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात: -  
"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में भारत में विद्युत से चलने वाले वाहनों को बढ़ावा देने के लिए विद्युत वाहन निर्माता कंपनियों के लिए आयात शुल्क में कमी की आवश्यकता के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है।"
111. कि प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात: -  
"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में महाराष्ट्र सहित राज्यों को देय जीएसटी प्रतिकर प्रदान किए जाने के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है।"
112. कि प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात: -  
"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में देश में जाति आधारित जनगणना करने और जनगणना के एकत्रित आंकड़ों को त्रुटिरहित बनाने के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है।"
113. कि प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात: -  
"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में कोविड-19 महामारी तथा उसके परिणामस्वरूप वर्ष 2020-21 में लागू लॉकडाउन के कारण जीडीपी वृद्धि दर गिरकर 7.3 तक आने के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है।"
114. कि प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात: -  
"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में देश में बढ़ती महंगाई पर नियंत्रण के लिए सरकार द्वारा उठाए जाने वाले कदमों के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है।"
115. कि प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात: -  
"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में कृषि क्षेत्र की दयनीय स्थिति में सुधार के लिए कोई प्रभावी कदम उठाने के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है।"

SHRI BENNY BEHANAN (CHALAKUDY): I beg to move:

25. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the steps to curb the unprecedented rise in prices of all essential commodities, including petrol and diesel."
26. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about providing adequate compensation to the flood affected states, particularly Kerala and Tamil Nadu."
27. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the steps to tackle incidents of attacks on writers and journalists in the country."
28. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to expedite Sabari Rail project in Kerala."
29. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about establishing sports universities in Kerala."
30. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about establishing Cultural universities in Kerala."
31. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to establish an All India Institute of Medical Sciences in the state of Kerala."
  
32. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to check the alleged increasing attacks and atrocities on minority community in the country."
33. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about expediting the land reforms in the country so as to provide land to the landless and home to the homeless."

SHRI HIBI EDEN (ERNAKULAM): I beg to move:

61. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to expedite pending metro projects in the country."
62. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to declare special package for fishermen community facing Covid-19 crisis."
63. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about special packages for protection of heritage structures located in Kochi Fort."
64. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the expansion of Kochi metro in the second phase of the project."
65. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about financial package for media personnel who died after contracting Covid-19."
66. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the risk on millions of tourism jobs due to Covid-19."
  
67. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about any proposal for providing special package to stabilize and support the tourism sector."
  
185. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the unprecedented rise in the prices of essential commodities including food grains, edible oils, petroleum products and cooking gas."

186. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
 "but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to provide direct cash transfer or minimum income support about 11 crore households worst affected by the Covid-19 outbreak and lockdown."
187. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
 "but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the rising Non Performing Assets of Indian banks."

ADV. ADOOR PRAKASH (ATTINGAL): I beg to move:

86. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
 "but regret that there is no mention in the Address about conflict along the India-China border."
87. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
 "but regret that there is no mention in the Address about growing threat of drug addiction among youth and manifold increase in seizure of drugs in the country."
88. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
 "but regret that there is no mention in the Address about crisis situation in the traditional fishing sector in the country."
89. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:--  
 "but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the alleged sale of Public Sector Undertakings including profit making ones."

**श्री प्रतापराव जाधव (बुलढाणा):** मैं प्रस्ताव करता हूँ:

116. कि प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए. अर्थात :-

- "किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में महाराष्ट्र सहित देश के विभिन्न हिस्सों में किसानों द्वारा की आत्महत्या की घटनाओं को रोकने के लिए किसी प्रभावी कदम के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है।"
117. कि प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात:-  
"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में देश के विभिन्न हिस्सों में सूखे और बाढ़ के कारण होने वाली भारी क्षति से निपटने के लिए एक प्रभावी नीति तैयार करने के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है।"
118. कि प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए अर्थात: -  
"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में महाराष्ट्र सहित देश भर के कई राज्यों में बेमौसम बारिश के कारण फसलों के नुकसान के लिए किसानों को मुआवजा प्रदान करने के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है।"
119. कि प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात: -  
"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में कृषि क्षेत्र की दयनीय स्थिति में सुधार के लिए कोई भी प्रभावी कदम उठाने के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है।"
120. कि प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात: -  
"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में किसानों के लाभ के लिए कीटनाशकों की कीमतों को कम करने के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है।"
121. कि प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात: -  
"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में बीज, उर्वरक, ट्रैक्टर और कृषि उपकरणों की खरीद पर किसानों को राजसहायता का सीधा लाभ प्रदान करने के लिए पर्याप्त कदम उठाने के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है।"
122. कि प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात: -  
"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में देश में किसानों की दयनीय स्थिति को देखते हुए धान के न्यूनतम समर्थन मूल्य में वृद्धि के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है।"
123. कि प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात: -  
"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में फसल बीमा योजनाओं सहित देश में किसानों के लिए विभिन्न योजनाओं के दोषपूर्ण कार्यान्वयन के कारण किसानों को कथित रूप से हुए नुकसान की भरपाई के लिए कोई प्रभावी कदम उठाने के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है।"
124. कि प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात: -  
"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में कोविड-19 वैश्विक महामारी के दौरान अपनी नौकरी खोने वाले लाखों बेरोजगार युवाओं को रोजगार प्रदान करने के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है।"
125. कि प्रस्ताव के अंत में निम्नलिखित जोड़ा जाए, अर्थात: -

"किंतु खेद है कि अभिभाषण में प्रधानमंत्री किसान सम्मान योजना की निधियों के वितरण में कथित भ्रष्टाचार को रोकने के लिए प्रभावी कदम उठाने हेतु कोई नीति तैयार करने के बारे में कोई उल्लेख नहीं है।"

SHRI KODIKUNNIL SURESH (MAVELIKKARA): I beg to move:

143. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the alleged attacks on churches and other places of worship in various parts of the country."
144. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to provide a compensation of minimum Rupees four lakhs each to the families of deceased due to COVID pandemic."
145. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the alleged highhandedness and arbitrary conduct of the Administrator of Lakshadweep."
146. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about according Scheduled Caste status to Dalits who converted to Christianity and any welfare scheme for them."
147. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about providing any comprehensive welfare package for rehabilitation of expatriates who lost their job and returned to India in the wake of COVID pandemic induced economic crisis and resultant retrenchment."
148. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to increase State share of GST compensation so that the losses in revenue due to implementation of GST and economic stagnation induced by pandemic and faulty policies of the Government may be addressed."

149. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to develop railway stations located in Mavelikkara Lok Sabha constituency including Chengannoor, Changanasseri, Mavelikkara, Munroturuttu, Ezhukone, Kuri, Thakazhi, Edathua, Cheriyanad, Sasthamkotta and Avaneeshwaram."
150. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to address the problem of water logging, agricultural loss and crop damage due to recurring floods in upper and lower Kuttanad region in Kerala and non-distribution of compensation to paddy growers and other farmers."
151. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about a comprehensive expert led study to find sustainable solutions for mitigating the damages caused by adverse climate change and recurring high tides causing rapid ground subsidence, saline water seepage and livelihood losses for people of Munroturuttu island in Kollam district and no declaration of financial compensation package for affected individuals."
152. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the rapid deterioration of Sasthamkotta lake, a Ramsar site due to a host of factors including increase in salinity, reduction in volume and pollution and declaration of a package for restoration of Sasthamkotta lake."

SHRI V.K. SREEKANDAN (PALAKKAD): I beg to move:

153. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about killing of 20 jawans in Galwan Valley by China."
154. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about helicopter crash in which Chief of Defence Staff and 13 others died."
155. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about alleged killing of civilians in Nagaland."

156. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about non vaccination of entire population even after two years of spread of Covid-19 pandemic."

157. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about non-acknowledgment of launching of Green Revolution by late Smt. Indira Gandhi, while government takes credit of providing food during Covid-19."

158. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to frame rules under the Citizenship (Amendment) Act, 2019."

159. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about alleged death of more than 700 farmers in the protest against the farm laws."

160. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about legislation of minimum support price guarantee law for agricultural produce."

161. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to boost export of ayurvedic medicines."

162. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about number of houses constructed under the Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojana-Gramin during last three years."

SHRI PRADYUT BORDOLOI (NAWGONG): I beg to move:

163. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to check the unabated river bank erosion in Assam exacerbated by climate change and owing to lack of coherent Central Government policy to arrest river

erosion and discontinuation of Flood Management Programme since 2014.”

164. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
“but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the unabated deforestation and man-made degradation of biodiversity due to rampant illegal “Rat Hole Coal Mining” in the wildlife sanctuaries and Reserved Forests of Upper Assam.”
165. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
“but regret that there is no mention in the Address about alleged Chinese transgression into Indian territory and abduction of 17 year old boy from Arunachal Pradesh.”
166. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the killing of civilians in firing allegedly by security forces in the Mon district of Nagaland in December 2021."
167. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the alarming shrinkage of employment generating economic activities, near total closure of the MSME sector, absence of big industries, and severe stagnation in the agricultural sector in Assam due to denial of guaranteed minimum support price on agricultural produce."
168. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the urgent need to address the plight of students in India due to longest school closures leading to widening learning gaps."

KUMARI RAMYA HARIDAS (ALATHUR): I beg to move:

169. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to uphold the ideals of Dr. B.R., Ambedkar."
170. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need for optimism utilization of Kisan Rails transporting perishable vegetables, fruits and agricultural produce."

171. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to tackle the menace of cyber thefts and frauds."

172. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to expedite tap water supply under the Har Ghar Jal scheme by 2024 which is moving at snail's pace."

173. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the K-Rail project of Kerala Government."

SHRI ADHIR RANJAN CHOWDHURY (BAHARAMPUR): I beg to move:

188. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the alleged Pegasus snooping by the Government."
189. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about massive distress caused to the common people due to unprecedented price rise of essential commodities."
190. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about unprecedented hardships caused to common people due to extraordinary rise in prices of petroleum products."
191. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the alleged occupation of more than 100 kms. of Indian territory by China during the last three years."
192. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the unemployment situation in the country."
194. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the ex-gratia payment to the families of patients who died due to COVID pandemic."
195. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about increasing the minimum support price for agriculture produce."

SHRI B. MANICKAM TAGORE (VIRUDHUNAGAR): I beg to move:

224. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
“but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the steps to establish a Textile Park in Virudhunagar, Tamil Nadu.”
225. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
“but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to expedite completion of AIIMS in Madurai.”
229. That at the *end* of the motion, the following be *added*, namely:-  
“but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the inclusion of Madurai Airport in bilateral air service as well as to upgrade it as International Airport.”

... (*Interruptions*)

**श्री कमलेश पासवान (बासगाँव):** माननीय अध्यक्ष जी, राहुल भाई ने अपने भाषण में मेरा नाम लिया और दलित कहकर मुझसे कहा that I am in a wrong party. माननीय अध्यक्ष जी, मैं इनको बताना चाहता हूँ कि आपकी नीति क्या रही है, आपकी दादी की, आपके पिता जी की, कांग्रेस की जो नीति रही है, वह आजतक फूट डालो और राज करो की रही है। उसी के नाते, जब पूरे देश की जनता इस बात को समझ गई है... (व्यवधान) इसलिए आपका यह हाल हो गया है कि मेरे जैसा एक छोटा-सा सांसद, कहाँ राहुल गांधी और कहाँ कमलेश पासवान? कमलेश पासवान के बाद इनको बोलने का मौका मिला। हम सब लोग सौभाग्यशाली हैं। मैं जिस पार्टी में हूँ, इस उम्र में ही मुझे मेरी पार्टी ने तीन बार सांसद बनने का मौका दिया, तीन बार टिकट दिया, इससे ज्यादा मुझे और क्या चाहिए। ये मुझे क्या ऑब्लाइज करेंगे, मेरी खुद की एक पहचान है। मैं तीन बार सांसद रहा हूँ और दो बार विधायक रहा हूँ। इन्होंने कहा कि मेरे पिता जी मारे गए, मेरे पिता जी भी मारे गए हैं। मेरे पिता जी भी एक रैली में मारे गए थे। इसलिए मैं भी इस देश के दर्द को जानता हूँ और क्षेत्र की सभी चीजों को जानता हूँ। इसलिए आप जब कभी किसी के बारे में पॉइंट करें, मैं यह नहीं कहूंगा क्यों यह असंसदीय भाषा हो जाएगी। इनके बस की बात नहीं है कि ये कमलेश पासवान को अपनी पार्टी में ले जाकर खुश कर सकें।

1917 hours

SHRI T. R. BAALU (SRIPERUMBUDUR): Hon. Speaker, Sir, I would like to profoundly thank you for giving me this opportunity. ....(Interruptions)

माननीय अध्यक्ष : श्री बालू साहब, आप भाषण के लिए खड़े हुए और कांग्रेस के लोग जा रहे हैं।

... (व्यवधान)

SHRI T. R. BAALU (SRIPERUMBUDUR): No, Sir, they are with me only.

....(Interruptions) We are all one. ....(Interruptions)

माननीय अध्यक्ष : आपका बायकाट कर रहे हैं।

... (व्यवधान)

SHRI T. R. BAALU (SRIPERUMBUDUR): Sir, on behalf of my leader, Dr. Thalpathy M.K. Stalin and my party, I would like to speak on the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address made by the hon. President of India on 31<sup>st</sup> January, 2021 on the floor of the Central Hall before the hon. Members of both the Houses of Parliament. I once again thank you for giving me this opportunity. Today, it is a normal day. There is no noise and I do not need to raise my voice.

Sir, incidentally, tomorrow is the Death Anniversary of the great Dr. C.N. Annadurai. We fondly call him 'Anna'. It is the 54<sup>th</sup> Anniversary of Dr. Anna. Our reverent leader Dr. Thalpathy Mu.Ka. Stalin will be paying the floral tribute on the memorial tomorrow morning.

Sir, I could only quote from his speech made in Rajya Sabha, when he was a Member of the Rajya Sabha. He said:

"I belong to the Dravidian stock, and I am proud to call myself a Dravidian. That does not mean that I am against a Gujarati or a Maharashtrian or a Bengali. I say it because Dravidian has got something different, something distinct, something concrete to offer to the nation at large."

(1920/SAN/PC)

The legacy of Dr. C.N. Annadurai would not be forgotten for ever. The legacy is for the country, for the Union of States, for the State itself.

Sir, the PM entered the Lok Sabha after making tall promises in the elections of 2014. In the election meetings, he had said that Rs. 15 lakh would be provided to each and every countryman. That was the promise made by the hon. Prime Minister during electioneering, but after entering the Lok Sabha and the Rajya Sabha, he has not made it good and Rs. 15 lakh are yet to come even today. I have not forgotten that. ... (*Interruptions*) Nobody will forget it.

At the same time, he had also mentioned in the election manifesto that two crore jobs would be provided for the youth every year. Now, seven and a half years have been completed and more than 15 crore jobs should have been created by the hon. Prime Minister, but I cannot forget that issue. I cannot forget even the thing he had promised on the floor of the House, and also outside the Parliament, that Indian farmers would be provided MSP shortly. He appealed to lakhs and lakhs of farmers who were agitating on the outskirts of Delhi 'Please go to your homes, go to your States. You go and live with your families. I am here to look after you.' He had made this promise and that promise has not been fulfilled. We expected all these things in the President's Address.

Beyond this, I am sorry to say that because of the disunity of the Opposition, including me also, the people who got the mandate of 37.36 per cent votes are sitting in the Ruling Party whereas the people who got 63 per cent votes are sitting in the Opposition. It is very sad. It is a deflection and distortion in a democracy.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, now I come to the point. Hon. Speaker is very much looking at me. I can only draw the attention of this House to para 34 of the President's Address. In para 34, the hon. President has said:

"Local languages are also being promoted through the National Education Policy. Emphasis is being laid on conducting important entrance examinations for undergraduate courses in Indian languages as well."

This is the point pronounced by the President of India on the floor of the Central Hall. What has happened? This is not new to India. Even today, in the IAS examination, people are writing examination in their own languages. As if it is something new to the House or new to the Parliamentarians, the President has said that he is going to bring local languages in the competitive examinations. It is not proper. It has been there for many years. What happened two to three years back in respect of the competitive examinations for the Railways and the Postal Department? The same Government, which is now coming forward through the President's Address to say that they are going to bring the local languages once again, denied the opportunity of conducting examination in the local languages in respect of competitive examinations for the Railways and the Postal Department. Finally, only when the administrative Ministry interfered, they brought back the concept of conducting competitive examinations in local languages once again. Since the DMK agitated in both the House of Parliament – inside the Parliament as well as outside the Parliament – this has happened and they have given the opportunity to write the competitive examinations in the local languages.

(1925/SNT/KDS)

The competitive examination for NEET is being held. It is a menace to Tamil students. More than 30 young students have sacrificed their lives. They have committed suicide in Tamil Nadu because they lost the ranks after writing the NEET examination.

1925 hours

(Dr. Kirit P. Solanki *in the Chair*)

What exactly is the problem? Nobody knows what has happened. What is happening in Tamil Nadu? The questions in NEET entrance examination are all from CBSE syllabus whereas our Tamil students who have studied up to +2 used to write the +2 examination in State Board syllabus. What has happened? There is a vast difference between CBSE syllabus and State Board syllabus. The Tamil students who are appearing for the NEET examination failed miserably. They lost their ranks. Finally, they committed suicide. More than 30 young students have committed suicide in Tamil Nadu. This matter was taken into consideration when my leader Dr. Stalin came to power and he had established a judicial committee under Justice A K Rajan. He has received more than 80,000 affidavits. The judges have received more than 80,000 affidavits

wherein they have categorically said our students cannot be subjected to the NEET examination. So, all the 80,000 affidavits have been submitted. From those affidavits, Justice A K Rajan has decided that we have to abolish the NEET examination forthwith. That is what they have advised the Government and the Government came forward along with the Opposition leaders. They have met my leader. Dr. Stalin met the Opposition leaders. They categorically said, okay, we will frame a Resolution to that effect, and Tamil Nadu Assembly has brought a Resolution first time in the history of Tamil Nadu Legislature. They have brought a Resolution to abolish the NEET examination and they have brought a Bill also. That Bill was approved and legislated on 13.09.2021. On the 18<sup>th</sup>, it has been sent to the Governor so that it can be sent to the President of India for his assent. But what has happened? For the past five months, the ... *(Not recorded)* is sitting over the Bill. How can ... *(Not recorded)* sit over the Bill?

As per articles 200 and 201, this should have been referred to the President of India for his assent. As per article 254, the President has to decide and send it to the State after assent. But this is not happening. Initially, my leader sent the General Secretary of the DMK Party who also happens to be the Water Resources Minister to meet the Governor. The Water Resources Minister met the Governor in person, requested him, and pleaded with him, but nothing happened. Afterwards, the Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu, Thalapathi Mu Ka Stalin himself went there to meet the Governor. What did he say? Nothing. He waited for one month. After one month, he requested the Members of Parliament belonging to all the parties, irrespective of party. They went with the petition to meet the President of India. The President of India was not well. That is why we handed over our petition to the President's Office. Afterwards, we met the hon. Home Minister of India. The Home Minister met us for more than 20 minutes. He heard us properly. He said he will call the HRD Ministry as well as the Health Ministry and take a proper decision quickly. But so far nothing has happened. That is why that has irritated us.

The DMK Members, especially I, had requested the President of India to intervene for which I feel sorry. It never happened. DMK stood up. On behalf of the DMK, not only DMK, but also the students who have been affected, who have sacrificed for the cause, 30 people who have sacrificed, I stood up and requested the President of India to kindly intervene.

(1930/SRG/CS)

The President has been asked to intervene in this matter to order the Governor of Tamil Nadu to send the Bill to the President. There is no other way for me. Till date, nothing has happened on the matter of NEET examinations. The issue of NEET is still pending. Moreover, in spite of all my friends going and meeting, nothing has happened. The Government is keeping a lukewarm attitude. I will tell the House what were the terms of reference of A.K. Rajan Committee. It is (1) whether NEET-based admission is an equitable method, and (2) whether socially and economically backward students are affected. On these two grounds, he has asked everyone to file affidavit. On receiving 80,000 affidavits, Justice A.K. Rajan advised Dr. Thalpathi. He brought the Bill and passed the Bill and sent the Bill to the Governor. The Governor is keeping it pending. I do not know how we are going to manage the situation. The person who is the constitutional head himself knows what the Constitution is, but he is not sending the Bill to the President for his assent. It is horrible and it cannot be tolerated.

When the delegation went to the Home Minister, the Home Ministry promised to assist us quickly for the flood damages which has occurred recently. The State of Tamil Nadu faced heavy floods three times and because of the floods, many house and many farmlands have perished. Even the paddy fields were destroyed. The farmers have lost crores and cores of rupees. The Central Committee came there, but the money from the National Disaster Restoration and Relief Fund has not come so far. They have not provided the funds. But he promised it during his speech. He said, 'before 31<sup>st</sup> January, we will send the money quickly to Tamil Nadu. But the State of Tamil Nadu is waiting. We have not yet got anything.

Finally, before I end my speech, I would like to say this. Tamil Nadu is known for many freedom fighters. I will name one or two. Velu Nachiyar, the Royal Queen waged a war against the Britishers with an army of 5000 soldiers. She won the war. She was the first Indian woman to fight against the Britishers. It happened in 1780, 100 years prior to Rani Jhansi fought against the Britishers. She fought with the British rulers and won the war. That lady's idol and picture have been depicted in a Republic Day float.

That was rejected by the Government of India. Mahakavi Bharathiyar's poems which he wrote used to set the water on fire during the Independence days. His portrait was supposed to be depicted in the Republic Day float. That was rejected by the Government. VO Chidambaram Pillai, who was the first freedom fighter who sailed two ships from Tuticorin to Colombo was very much against the British rulers. He established a company against the East India company. He established a merchant shipping, but the hero of the freedom movement has not been entertained by the Central Government by not allowing to depict the floats on Republic Day.

(1935/AK/KN)

One person who is among the selectors asked another selector : "Is V. O. Chidambaram Pillai a trader?". The Selection Committee has been established without any knowhow about the freedom movement. These are all the things that I wanted to mention here.

They may not entertain freedom fighters like Veeramangai Queen Velu Nachiyar, V. O. Chidambaram Pillai, Mahakavi Bharathi, but at the same time the Government of India should know that my Leader, Dr. Thalpathi M. K. Stalin, has made it good in his Republic Day parade. All the floats were on the run. We had people in the function as well as throughout the length and breadth of Tamil Nadu and even now it is running where each and every Tamilian will have get to look at it, and get inspired by the valour and sacrifice of all those people. Along with them, there are a lot of other freedom fighters shown on those floats. I could mention some of the most important and legendary freedom fighters by name including Thanthai Periyar, Kamarajar, Rajaji, Muthuramalinga Thevar, Kakkan, Veerapandiya Kattabomman, Puli Thevar, Maruthu Sagodharargal, Dheeran Chinnamalai, Veeran Azhagumuthu Kone, Maaveeran Pollan, Veera Mangai Kuyili, Veeran Sundaralingam, Ondiveeran, Vanchinathan, V. V. S. Aiyar, Tiruppur Kumaran. These are the freedom fighters whose floats are being depicted and floats of these persons are taken around through the length and breadth of Tamil Nadu day in day out.

Finally, I want to say that Tamil Nadu has reeled under severe flood. On 16/11/2021, 25/11/2021 and 15/12/2021 the Memorandum demanding Rs. 6,230 crore has been sent to the Government of India by my Leader, but so far nothing has been received by the Government of Tamil Nadu.

We are suffering a lot. I think that the Government of India will have to consider it without any further loss of time. We are suffering due to COVID too as we have spent about Rs. 8,989 crore from NDRF and SDRF, but that money has not come. The new demand made for Rs. 6,230 crore has also not been received.

What is happening in India? Are we living in the Union of States? If we are really living in the Union of States and if we are living in one-India, then I think that the Prime Minister of India should help us. We cannot run all the way to Delhi with begging bowls. It is not fair on the part of my friend, the Prime Minister of India. He has to look at each and every State on par with UP, Bihar and Gujarat. This is not proper. Tamil Nadu is one of the States, which has got the ability to spend money and has got the wherewithal to go for infrastructure facilities. All these things should be considered properly by the hon. Prime Minister and the Home Minister. They should come forward very quickly to render justice to Tamil Nadu. Thank you very much, Sir.

(ends)

HON. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Baalu ji. The next speaker is Prof. Sougata Ray.

1939 hours

PROF. SOUGATA RAY (DUM DUM): Sir, I rise to speak on the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address, and I oppose the Motion of Thanks and support all the Amendments, which are brought on this Motion of Thanks.

Unfortunately, all the Members of AITC are in Kolkata where our Chairman's election is taking place today.

(1940/SPR/GG)

Only our colleague, Sushri Mahua Moitra, who will speak tomorrow, is here. But it doesn't matter. I speak with the courage of conviction. What I want to say is that this Government has given a series of information about what it has done but it is the same thing - Ayushman Bharat, Pradhan Mantri Garib Kalyan Anna Yojana, Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojana, Jal Jeevan Mission, PM Kisan Samman Nidhi, SHGs, Ujjwala Scheme under which the Government gave three cylinders, which have run out, the GST, Pradhan Mantri Gatishakti National Master Plan. Ordnance factories, etc. etc. There is nothing new unfortunately in the President's Address.

But there are many things which are not mentioned in the President's Address, which I want to. Why was Amar Jawan Jyoti at India Gate extinguished? Was it because it was initiated by Indira Gandhi? Mr. Modi wants to delete history. Why West Bengal's Netaji's tableau was cancelled on the Republic Day parade? We had the same Netaji's tableau in Kolkata. Why have they rejected? The Prime Minister said that he will set up a granite statue of Netaji at India Gate but as a temporary measure, he set up a hologram. You know about hologram? It takes several laser beams getting together to create a hologram. That hologram has vanished from India Gate. With that, BJP's love for Netaji has vanished because Netaji and BJP would never be together.

What did Gandhi say about Netaji? Exactly a week before his assassination on January 30, Gandhiji had happily taken note of Subhas Chandra Bose's birthday. In his final eulogy to the departed leader, Mahatma pointed out that Subhas knew no provincialism nor communal differences. This is where Netaji was different from the BJP. In his brave Army, men and women were drawn from all over India without distinction, and evoked affection and loyalty which a very few have been able to evoke. When he was asked by a lawyer, for a good definition of Hinduism, Gandhi simply said, Hinduism

regarded all religions as worthy of all respect. Netaji, the Mahatma believed was such a Hindu. Therefore, in memory of that great patriot he called upon Indians to clean their hearts of all communal bitterness. That is why, BJP, which has communal bitterness in their hearts, have no right to respect, to honour, Netaji.

What did Jawaharlal Nehru said, when he was raising the flag at Lal Qila on 15<sup>th</sup> August, 1947? He said, on this day we must remember all those who have made sacrifices and suffered for the cause of Independence. It is needless for me to name all of them but I cannot help mentioning Subhas Chandra Bose, who left this country and formed the Indian National Army abroad and fought bravely for the freedom of the country. He hoisted the flag in the foreign countries. When the day came for hoisting it on the Red Fort, he was not to see his dream fulfilled. This is what Jawaharlal Nehru said about Netaji. ... *(Interruptions)* You have no respect. Nishikant, you are a *pucca* RSS man; you keep quiet. You have no right to speak on Netaji. We come from Bengal, and Bengal has sacrificed for the freedom struggle. You go to the Cellular Jail in Andaman; three quarters of the Cellular Jail detainees were Bengalis. Kudhiram was one of the first martyrs who died on the gallows. This is the Bengal that this Prime Minister is insulting.

(1945/UB/RV)

Sir, the hon. Prime Minister is hitting out at two of the basic principles. One is 'secularism' and the other is 'federalism'. Just now, Mr. Baalu was speaking about NEET. Why should we impose a National Eligibility cum Entrance Test? Why can the States not have their own medical admission test? Thirteen boys and girls have committed suicide in Tamil Nadu. The hon. Prime Minister wants control over medical seats across the country.

Recently, the Central Government issued a circular that if the IAS officers are asked to join Central deputation, they must do. No permission from the State Government is needed. Is it not an assault on the federalism itself? The Government is destroying this.

The worst example is, why has the Centre appointed Governors? If they want to reward their ... *(Expunged as ordered by the Chair)* they can. ... *(Interruptions)*. What is wrong in this? ... *(Interruptions)*

माननीय सभापति (डॉ. (प्रो.) किरिट प्रेमजीभाई सोलंकी) : इसे कार्यवाही से निकाल देंगे।

संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री तथा संस्कृति मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री अर्जुन राम मेघवाल): सर, इसे संसद की कार्यवाही से हटाइए।... (व्यवधान)

माननीय सभापति : इस शब्द को संसदीय कार्यवाही से हटा देंगे।

... (व्यवधान)

PROF. SOUGATA RAY (DUM DUM): Why are they putting Governors who are at loggerheads with the State Governments? In Tamil Nadu, they are complaining about one Governor who disrespects Ministers in Tamil Nadu. In Maharashtra, there is some ... (*Not recorded*). He is disturbing the Maharashtra Government. ... (*Interruptions*). In West Bengal, we have found a Governor who tweets every day. Under what article of the Constitution can the Governor tweet? I am not naming anybody. ... (*Interruptions*).

HON. CHAIRPERSON: You are a very senior Member. You should speak in a dignified manner.

डॉ. निशिकांत दुबे (गोड्डा): सर, इन्होंने ... (कार्यवाही-वृत्तान्त में सम्मिलित नहीं किया गया) का नाम लिया।

प्रो. सौगत राय (दमदम): अरे, ... (कार्यवाही-वृत्तान्त में सम्मिलित नहीं किया गया) नाम नहीं है, टाइटल है। उसका नाम है ... (कार्यवाही-वृत्तान्त में सम्मिलित नहीं किया गया)।

डॉ. निशिकांत दुबे (गोड्डा): सर, ये सब नाम डिलीट करवाइए।... (व्यवधान)

PROF. SOUGATA RAY (DUM DUM): I am just mentioning the post. I am not naming anybody. ... (*Interruptions*). Sir, we are rewriting history. People from Kerala are here. The names of 387 Moplah martyrs were removed from the dictionary of India's freedom struggle (1857-1947). How could this Government do this? What about hate speeches encouraged by the hon. Prime Minister's visit to Ram Mandir? The hate *speechwalas* at Haridwar in a *dharam sansad* said, "we must kill the Muslims". What country are we living in? Secularism is under attack. Who was ... (*Expunged as ordered by the Chair*)? A Delhi BJP leader who provoked riots. Who was ... (*Expunged as ordered by the Chair*)? A Member of this House. He said, "Goli Maaro". ... (*Interruptions*). 'गोली मारो' हमारे खिलाफ सी.ए.ए. के पक्ष में जो है, गोली मारो। He is still a Minister. Another Minister's name is ... (*Expunged as ordered by the Chair*). His son mowed down. ... (*Interruptions*)

डॉ. निशिकांत दुबे (गोड्डा): सर, मेरा प्वायंट-ऑफ-ऑर्डर है।... (व्यवधान)

प्रो. सौगत राय (दमदम): कुछ प्वायंट-ऑफ-ऑर्डर नहीं है।... (व्यवधान) I am not saying anything. सर, ये कुछ नहीं जानता है।... (व्यवधान)

DR. NISHIKANT DUBEY (GODDA): Sir, I will read Rule 352: "A member while speaking shall not make personal reference by way of making an allegation imputing a motive to or questioning the *bona fides* of any other member of the House...". Shri Anurag Thakur is a Member of this House. Shri Ajay Mishra Teni is also a Member of this House. He cannot speak like this. ... (*Interruptions*).

**माननीय सभापति :** अनुराग ठाकुर जी का और अजय मिश्रा जी का नाम डिलीट कर दीजिए।

... (व्यवधान)

**प्रो. सौगत राय (दमदम):** सर, आप यह सलाह मत दीजिए, मैं हाउस का रूल्स जानता हूँ... (व्यवधान) ... (अध्यक्षपीठ के आदेशानुसार कार्यवाही-वृत्तान्त में सम्मिलित नहीं किया गया।) इस हाउस का मेम्बर है। मैंने बोला कि उसने बोला था कि 'गोली मारो'... (व्यवधान)

**डॉ. निशिकांत दुबे (गोड्डा):** सर, वे यहां डिफेंड करने के लिए नहीं है। इन्हें इसके लिए नोटिस देना है... (व्यवधान)

**प्रो. सौगत राय (दमदम):** कुछ नहीं देना है... (व्यवधान)

**माननीय सभापति :** आप जो नाम लीजिएगा, वह रिकॉर्ड में नहीं जाएगा। आप बाकी जो भी बोलिए।

... (व्यवधान)

**प्रो. सौगत राय (दमदम):** सर, ठीक है। एक ... (कार्यवाही-वृत्तान्त में सम्मिलित नहीं किया गया।) मिनिस्टर फॉर इंफॉर्मेशन एण्ड ब्रॉडकास्टिंग है... (व्यवधान)

**डॉ. निशिकांत दुबे (गोड्डा):** सर, यह ... (कार्यवाही-वृत्तान्त में सम्मिलित नहीं किया गया।) अनपार्लियामेंट्री वर्ड है... (व्यवधान)

**प्रो. सौगत राय (दमदम):** क्या ... (कार्यवाही-वृत्तान्त में सम्मिलित नहीं किया गया।) अनपार्लियामेंट्री है?... (व्यवधान)

PROF. SOUGATA RAY (DUM DUM): Can I use ... (*Not recorded*)? वह बोला कि 'गोली मारो'... (व्यवधान)

HON. CHAIRPERSON: We will see the proceedings. मगर, आप गरिमापूर्ण भाषा में बोलिए।

... (व्यवधान)

(1950/MY/KMR)

**प्रो. सौगत राय (दमदम):** आप होम में एक मिनिस्टर ऑफ स्टेट हैं। उनके लड़के ने चार फार्मर्स को कुचल दिया। वह अभी भी मिनिस्ट्री में है। इन सब बातों को प्रेसीडेंट ने क्यों नहीं बोला। ऑफिसर ने कुछ लिख दिया और उन्होंने नहीं बोला... (व्यवधान)

सर, कोई कोप में नहीं है। इन लोगों ने जे. एंड के. के बारे में बोला। हाउस में यह बोला गया कि हम जे. एंड के. को सुधारेंगे। वहाँ रोज मिलिटेंट एकटीविटी होती है। इस होम मिनिस्टर को क्या अधिकार था?

Sir, what right did this Home Minister have to abrogate Article 370 and put Farooq Abdullah, a sitting Member of this House, and Omar Abdullah and Mehbooba Mufti who were former Members, in jail? What have they achieved in Jammu and Kashmir? They increased the divide further.

सर, यह सबसे बड़ा क्वेश्चन है। इससे आप भी चिंतित होंगे। जब आप पार्लियामेंट में घुसते हैं तो आप देखते हैं कि चारों तरफ कंस्ट्रक्शन हो रहा है। यहाँ टाटा कंस्ट्रक्शन हो रहा है। वह क्या बना रहा है? नया पार्लियामेंट बन रहा है और सेन्ट्रल विस्टा बदल रहा है। इसमें कितना खर्च है? इसमें 20 हजार करोड़ रुपये खर्च हो रहा है। यह किसी के ... (अध्यक्षपीठ के आदेशानुसार कार्यवाही-वृत्तान्त में सम्मिलित नहीं किया गया।) पैसा है कि आप 20 हजार करोड़ रुपये खर्च करेंगे। अभी कोविड का समय है। लोगों के पास पैसा नहीं है। उनके लिए वैक्सीन नहीं है। आप 20 हजार करोड़ रुपये खर्च कर रहे हैं। यह ... (अध्यक्षपीठ के आदेशानुसार कार्यवाही-वृत्तान्त में सम्मिलित नहीं किया गया।) बन रहा है।

सर, वह पार्लियामेंट नहीं है, बल्कि वह ... (अध्यक्षपीठ के आदेशानुसार कार्यवाही-वृत्तान्त में सम्मिलित नहीं किया गया।) बन रहा है। हम इसके खिलाफ हैं... (व्यवधान)

HON. CHAIRPERSON (DR. (PROF.) KIRIT PREMJBHAI SOLANKI): Delete all these words.

**प्रो. सौगत राय (दमदम):** सर, हम इस सेन्ट्रल विस्टा का पूरा खिलाफ हैं। It is a wastage of time. ... (Interruptions)

HON. CHAIRPERSON: Sougata Ray ji, you are a very senior Member. आप जो बोलते हैं, उसको लोग फॉलो करते हैं। आप जरा गरिमापूर्ण भाषा में बोलिए।

**प्रो. सौगत राय (दमदम):** सर, यह नहीं होना चाहिए। पार्लियामेंट हाउस रहते हुए भी नया बिल्डिंग बन रहा है। किसके पास रुपया है? क्या किसी के पास ज्यादा पैसा है कि किसी के ख्याल से नया ताजमहल बनेगा। यह लोकतंत्र है और हम लोग बोलेंगे। जब तक गले से खून नहीं निकलेगा, तब तक हम इसके खिलाफ बोलते जाएंगे।

सर, आपने देखा है, मैं भी सुप्रिया जी के साथ गया था, जब फार्मर्स लोग एजिटेट कर रहे थे। खुले आसमान में फार्मर्स लोगों ने पूरे एक साल तक आंदोलन किया। अब यू.पी. का चुनाव आ रहा है। इन्होंने डर के मारे फार्मर्स लॉ को विड्रो किया। इसमें 700 फार्मर्स की जान चली गई। इसके बारे में प्रेसीडेंट ऑफ इंडिया ने एक भी बात नहीं बोली। क्या ये लोग देश की संतान नहीं थे? इन लोगों ने ऐसा किया और यह आपको याद है।

सर, यह सरकार ... (Not recorded) की सरकार है। सब बेचो, एयर इंडिया को बेच दिया। कैसे बेचा? सरकार ने 51 हजार करोड़ रुपये के पुराने लोन का शोध किया, फिर टाटा जी ने 18 हजार करोड़ रुपये देकर उतने बड़े एयर इंडिया को खरीद लिया। यह किसकी संपत्ति है? सरकार ने इतने दिनों में इसे बनाया, लेकिन आप पब्लिक सेक्टर को बेच रहे हैं। ऑर्डनेंस फैक्ट्री को कॉर्पोरेटाइज कर रहे हैं। मैं रोज सुनता हूँ कि आप एल.आई.सी. को बेच देंगे।

पंडित नेहरू ने उसको लोगों के स्वार्थ के लिए नेशनलाइज किया था। आप इतना बड़े डॉक्टर होकर इसके खिलाफ आवाज नहीं उठाएंगे, आप चेयर पर बैठे रहेंगे और प्रेसीडेंट भी कुछ नहीं बोलेंगे। आप लोग इस बारे में सोचिए।

सर, मैं और दो-चार बातें कहूँगा, मुझे ज्यादा नहीं बोलना है। महुआ जी बोलेंगी, वह मुझसे अच्छा बोलती हैं।

सर, नागालैंड के मोन डिस्ट्रिक्ट में छह आदमियों को मार दिया गया। उन पर कौन गोली चलायी? सेन्ट्रल पुलिस ने गोली चलाया। इस बारे में प्रेसीडेंट ने क्यों नहीं थोड़ा दुख प्रकट किया? टी.एम.सी. के लोग जब त्रिपुरा जाते हैं तो उन पर रोज अटैक होता है। हमारा एक सदस्य मुजीबुर्रहमान ... (Not recorded) के हाथों से मर गया। उसका जवाब कौन देगा?

सर, प्रेसीडेंट ने इतना भाषण दिया। यह छोटा-सा भाषण है, लेकिन इसमें फ्यूल प्राइस का कोई मंशन नहीं है। वह बोलते हैं कि हमने उज्ज्वला स्कीम दी। तीन सिलेंडर देकर बोलते हैं कि हम महिलाओं का सशक्तिकरण कर रहे हैं। अभी महिलाओं को 900 से लेकर 1000 रुपये में गैस सिलेंडर खरीदना पड़ता है।

(1955/CP/RCP)

इसको थोड़ा मंशन भी नहीं किया। रोज जो पेट्रोल और डीजल का भाव बढ़ता है, उसके बारे में प्रेसीडेंट को कुछ बोलना नहीं है। सर, यह आप सोचिए।

हम लोग बार-बार बोले रहे थे, ये जो परिजाई श्रमिक हैं, माइग्रेंट लेबर्स हैं, इनको दस हजार रुपये दीजिए, तब इकोनॉमी मूव करेगी। अभिजीत विनायक बनर्जी, नोबल लोरिएट, उन्होंने बोला कि इकोनॉमी को रिवाइव करना है, तो कैश सपोर्ट देना है। सरकार नहीं सुनेगी। बोलते हैं कि हम लोग स्मॉल इंडस्ट्रीज को लोन दे रहे हैं। अरे, वह भूखा मर जाएगा तो स्मॉल इंडस्ट्री कहां रहेगी? कितने लोग भूखे मरे, इसका सरकार ने कोई हिसाब नहीं दिया।

सर, पेगासस के बारे में राहुल गांधी जी ने बताया... (व्यवधान) ये लोग बोलेंगे कि सुप्रीम कोर्ट में केस है। कुछ नहीं है। सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने एक कमेटी बनाई है, वह राय देगी। उसको लेकर हम तो रोज हाउस स्टॉल कर सकते हैं, हम नहीं कर रहे हैं, डिबेट होने दे रहे हैं। यह मत सोचिए कि हम उठा नहीं पाएंगे। हम जब चाहेंगे, तब उठाएंगे, लोकतंत्र जब तक है। आप लोकतंत्र का गला घोटने की कोशिश कर रहे हैं। हम पर स्पाइंग कर रहे हैं। हम इसके खिलाफ आवाज उठाएंगे और उठाते रहेंगे।

सर, इस बार पद्म अवार्ड दिए। यह स्पीच में बोला है। हमारे यहां एक 90 साल की सबसे बड़ी आर्टिस्ट हैं, अधीर जी जानते हैं, संध्या मुखर्जी। उनको पद्मश्री दिया। पद्मश्री 30 साल के लड़के को दिया जाएगा, जो ओलम्पिक में सोना जीता, उसको दे सकते हैं। आप 90 साल की महिला को देकर उसका अपमान कर रहे हैं। She went into coma. She was so shocked. यह सरकार का काम है। किसी को जानते नहीं हैं। बोलते हैं कि हम पद्म अवार्ड दे रहे हैं, हम बहुत बड़ा काम कर रहे हैं।

सर, मेरे दोस्त दानिश अली बोल रहे थे। हाथरस में क्या हुआ? एक लड़की का बलात्कार करके उसकी हत्या कर दी। उसके बाद उसे जिंदा जला दिया गया ... (व्यवधान) ये बोल रहे थे कि योगी जी के राज्य में बहुत अच्छा चल रहा है। महिला जिंदा जलती है ... (Not recorded) के राज में। यही नारा चारों तरफ फैल गया। आप जानते हैं कि उन्नाव में क्या हुआ? ... (Not recorded) का एक विधायक लड़की का बलात्कार करने के आरोप में अभी भी जेल में है।

सर, कानून की स्थिति बहुत खराब है। सर, लोग बड़े दुखी हैं। सर, हमारे बंगाल में एक कवि थे, जो मर चुके हैं। उन्होंने एक कविता लिखी थी।

\*"Man is alone, you stand by him.

Come, float with him, stand with love.

Man is crying a lot, you stand by him.

Man is alone, you stand by him."

जो इंसान अकेला है, आज हम उसके साथ खड़े होना चाहते हैं। हम माइग्रेंट लेबर, गरीब लोग और बेरोजगार नौजवानों के साथ खड़े होना चाहेंगे। ये लोग 303 की बात कर सकते हैं, लेकिन असल फैसला जनता करेगी। देश की जनता-जनार्दन ने जब चाहा, बड़ी-बड़ी सरकार का तख्ता पलट दिया। मुझे विश्वास है, सर, शायद मैं नहीं रहूँगा, लेकिन यह तख्ता पलट जाएगा। जैसे ये चला रहे हैं, पूरी हुकूमत हाथ में ले रहे हैं, इनका तख्ता पलट जाएगा। इसी के साथ मैं अपना भाषण समाप्त करता हूँ। जय हिन्द।

(इति)

**माननीय सभापति (डॉ. (प्रो.) किरिट प्रेमजीभाई सोलंकी):** बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद।

डॉ. निशिकांत दुबे।

**डॉ. निशिकांत दुबे (गोड्डा):** सर, सौगत दा ने मेरा नाम लिया। मुझे फक्र और गर्व है कि मैं आरएसएस का स्वयंसेवक हूँ। इन्होंने कहा कि मैं आरएसएस का स्वयंसेवक हूँ, मेरा मुँह बंद करा दिया। ये अपने बड़े भाई तथागत राय जी की ही किताब यदि पढ़ लेते, जिन्होंने पूरी रिसर्च की है कि अम्बेडकर जी के साथ किस तरह से कांग्रेस ने किया। श्यामा प्रसाद मुखर्जी जी ने किस तरह की पार्टी बनाई। नजरूल इस्लाम, जिस सेक्युलरिज्म की ये बात करते हैं, उनको श्यामा प्रसाद मुखर्जी जी ने, जब उनकी तबियत खराब हुई तो दो साल तक मधुपुर, जो मेरी कांस्टीट्यूएन्सी है, वहाँ रखा। जब इनको अपने बड़े भाई के बारे में सम्मान नहीं है तो आरएसएस और मेरे बारे में क्या सम्मान होगा। मैं यही आपको बताना चाहता हूँ ... (व्यवधान)